



Staff Report

If this information is required in an alternate accessible format, please contact the Accessibility Coordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131.

Report To:	General Government Committee		
Date of Meeting:	January 10, 2022	Report Number:	LGS-001-22
Submitted By:	Rob Maciver, Director of Legislative Services		
Reviewed By:	Andrew C. Allison, CAO	Resolution#:	GG-014-22
File Number:		By-law Number:	2022-003
Report Subject:	2022 Municipal Elections – Compliance Audit Committee Terms of Reference		

Recommendations:

1. That LGS-001-22, and any related communication items, be received;
2. That the By-law appended as Attachment 1 to LGS-001-22, to update the Terms of Reference for the Municipality of Clarington's Compliance Audit Committee, be approved; and
3. That all interested parties listed in LGS-001-22 and any delegations be advised of Council's decision.

Report Overview

This report outlines the recommended changes to the Terms of Reference and provides the updated Rules of Procedure for the Compliance Audit Committee arising out of Staff's review. As well, the current term of Clarington's existing Compliance Audit Committee will end October 1, 2022.

1. Background

- 1.1 [Section 88.37](#) of the [Municipal Elections Act, 1996, as amended](#), (MEA) requires that every municipality appoint a compliance audit committee prior to October 1 of an election year.
- 1.2 The Committee has the full authority, provided by Sections 88.33 to 88.37 of the MEA, to address applications requesting an audit of a candidate's or third party advertiser's election campaign finances and to consider reports from the Clerk citing apparent instances of over-contribution to municipal campaigns. In accordance with the MEA, this authority includes, but is not limited to, the following:
 - review applications for a compliance audit and grant or reject audit requests within 30 days of receipt;
 - where an audit is granted, appoint an auditor and review the audit report;
 - following the audit, decide whether legal proceedings shall be commenced; and
 - within 30 days after receiving a report from the Clerk, under Sections 88.34 and 88.36 (dealing with apparent campaign contributions in excess of permitted limits), the Compliance Audit Committee shall meet to consider the report and decide whether to commence a legal proceeding against a contributor for an apparent contravention, if applicable.
- 1.3 The current Terms of Reference were adopted by [By-law 2018-024](#), arising out of [Report CLD-009-18](#), and the changes were mostly as a result of changes to the MEA.

2. Changes

Terms of Reference

- 2.1 Clerk's Division Staff have had several meetings with other Durham Area Clerk's and worked on a common Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure, which forms the basis of the proposed Clarington documents (attached).
- 2.2 Although the layout of the terms of reference has changed substantially, the main points remain the same, including the remuneration.
- 2.3 One thing that has changed is that Staff is recommending appointing four members, three of which will be the main members, with one as an alternate. The alternate member will attend all of the meetings, but will not be a voting member until they are required. This covers off a concern about "losing a member" in case they have a conflict or they are unable to fulfill their duties. With the previous appointment of only three members – if a member is lost after the new term of Council starts, it would put the new Council in a position of appointing a new member to oversee a case where potentially a Member of Council was involved. This change will result in an increased cost as we will need to pay for the extra training and attendance at each meeting, but it is felt that is a better approach than coming back to Council to fill a vacancy.

Rules of Procedure

- 2.4 The MEA requires that the Municipal Clerk establish administrative practices and procedures for the Committee to carry out their duties. Council does not approve these procedures, the updated procedure is provided as Attachment 2, for information purposes.

3. Current Committee

- 3.1 After the Terms of Reference were updated in 2018, arising out of [Report CLD-013-18](#), Council appointed the current Committee for the 2018 Municipal Elections.
- 3.2 The [current Committee](#) consists of three appointed members: Paul Jones, Ryan Frost, and JoAnne Swaine.
- 3.3 As of the writing of this report, the 2018-2022 Committee [has only met once](#).

4. Financial Implications

- 4.1 The Municipality is responsible for any costs resulting from the review of the applications submitted to the Clarington Municipal Election Compliance Audit Committee. These costs include:
- Committee members' retainer (\$400/member) including an initial training session,
 - Committee members' per diem of \$350 for each meeting,
 - Committee member mileage (recommended rate as per Municipality's prevailing standard rate),
 - Auditor's costs to perform an audit,
 - Costs related to the Committee's operations and activities (i.e. copying, postage, etc.),
 - legal costs related to an appeal to the Ontario Court of Justice with respect to a decision of the Committee, and
 - legal costs to undertake legal action against the candidate for violations of the elections finance provisions of the MEA.
 - Staff time to make arrangements for meetings; attend meeting to take minutes; distribute necessary correspondence following the meeting; possible actions related to arrangements of auditor or legal action.
- 4.2 Costs for advertising the vacancies will be included as part of the normal advertisement process.
- 4.3 Any costs incurred for a compliance audit during the Term of Council would be charged to the Municipal Election reserve. These costs are difficult to estimate because they depend entirely on the unforeseen volume of applications/cases.

5. Formation of Next Committee

- 5.1 Following the adoption of a new Terms of Reference, Staff will begin recruitment for the appointment of the next Committee for the 2022 Municipal Elections. Staff will advertise in the local paper, and on the municipal website, detailing the selection criteria. Additionally, staff will contact the Institution of Chartered Accountants of Ontario; the Law Society of Upper Canada; Durham Regional Police Services; and UOIT, and former applicants.
- 5.2 The following selection criteria are recommended:
- a) Demonstrated knowledge and understanding of municipal election campaign financing rules;
 - c) Proven analytical and decision- making skills;
 - d) Experience working on committees boards, adjudicative bodies, task forces or similar settings;
 - b) Experience in accounting and audit, law, law enforcement, academics, or municipal administration from related fields;
 - e) Demonstrated knowledge of quasi-judicial proceedings;
 - f) Availability and willingness to attend meetings; and
 - g) Excellent oral and written communication skills
- 5.3 At the close of the application period, in accordance with appointment protocol, all applications be forwarded to Council for consideration, selection, and appointment effective October 1, 2022 to October 1, 2026 or until such time the applicable Committee has disposed of any remaining matters in accordance with the Act, whichever is later.

6. Concurrence

Not Applicable.

7. Conclusion

It is respectfully recommended that, to fulfill the requirements of the MEA, the proposed changes to the Terms of Reference be approved, and that the draft by-law be approved by Council.

Staff Contact: June Gallagher, Municipal Clerk, 905-623-3379 ext. 2102 or jgallagher@clarington.net.

Attachments:

Attachment 1 – Draft By-law to update the Terms of Reference

Attachment 2 – Updated Clerk's Rules of Procedure

Interested Parties:

There are no interested parties to be notified of Council's decision.

**2022 Municipal and School Board Election
Clarington Compliance Audit Committee
Terms of Reference**

1. Name:

- 1.1. The name of the Committee is the “2022 Clarington Municipal Elections Compliance Audit Committee” (“the Committee”).

2. Definitions:

- 2.1. **Clerk** means the Clerk or secretary of the Municipality, or their designate.
- 2.2. **Municipality** means the Municipality of Clarington.

3. Mandate:

- 3.1. The Committee is established pursuant to the requirements of section 88.37 of the Municipal Elections Act, 1996, S.O., 1996, c. 32, as amended (“the Act”) for the Participating Bodies.
- 3.2. The powers and functions of the Committee are set out in section 88.33 to 88.37 of the Act.

4. Term of Committee:

- 4.1. The term of appointment for the Committee shall be concurrent with the term of office of the council or local board elected in 2022 and shall therefore serve for four years commencing on October 1, 2022 and concluding on October 1, 2026 or until such time the applicable Committee has disposed of any remaining matters in accordance with the Act, whichever is later.

5. Composition:

- 5.1. Council shall appoint three members and one alternate member.
- 5.2. When a compliance audit application from an elector, or a report from the Clerk indicating a candidate or registered third party has contravened any of the contribution limits under section 88.9 of the Act, is received, the Committee comprised of three members shall meet and consider the application and/or report in accordance with the Act. The alternate member shall also attend all meetings but shall not be a voting member unless another member is unable to fulfill their duties.
- 5.3. The following persons are ineligible for appointment:
 - 5.3.1. Employees or officers of any of the Participating Bodies;

**2022 Municipal and School Board Election
Clarington Compliance Audit Committee
Terms of Reference**

- 5.3.2. A member of council or of a local board of any of the Participating Bodies;
- 5.3.3. Any persons who are candidates in an election of any of the Participating Bodies for which the Committee is established; or,
- 5.3.4. Any persons who are registered third parties in an election of any of the Participating Bodies for which the Committee is established.
- 5.4. Should an appointed Committee Member accept employment with the Municipality or register as a candidate or a third party with the Municipality, they will have been deemed to have resigned.
- 5.5. All Committee Members shall agree, in writing, that they will not work or volunteer for, or contribute to, any candidate or registered third party in any capacity in an election of the Municipality.
- 5.6. If a Member of the Committee is identified as having participated or contributed to a candidate's campaign or registered third party, that person shall not be eligible as a Member with respect to a Compliance Audit Committee application.

6. Conduct of Members:

- 6.1. Members of the Committee shall comply and conduct themselves in accordance with Clarington's Compliance Audit Committee Administrative Practices and Procedures.
- 6.2. Members shall not use their position on the Committee for any personal or political gain.

7. Remuneration:

- 7.1. Remuneration will be as follows:
 - 7.1.1. \$400.00 retainer fee (costs will be shared equally by the Participating Bodies) for those individuals on the roster. The retainer fee shall cover attendance at a mandatory training session and review of periodic updates or information supplied by the Clerk. Payment of the retainer fee covers the four year term. The per meeting rate shall cover review of background or agenda materials as required in preparation for a meeting.; and
 - 7.1.2. \$350.00 per meeting attended, plus mileage in accordance with the rate normally paid to employees of the Municipality.

**2022 Municipal and School Board Election
Clarington Compliance Audit Committee
Terms of Reference**

8. Membership Selection:

- 8.1. At a minimum, the recruitment of persons shall be advertised in a local newspaper(s) having general circulation and on the municipal website. Other recruitment measures may be initiated by the Clerk.
- 8.2. All applicants will be required to complete an application.
- 8.3. Applicants must have the ability to understand, and apply, the election campaign finance provisions of the Act and must remain impartial in order to fulfill their responsibilities.
- 8.4. Preference will be given to candidates that have experience related to compliance audit activities or investigative or adjudicative processes.
- 8.5. The following criteria will be considered when appointing members:
 - 8.5.1. Demonstrated knowledge and understanding of municipal election campaign financing rules;
 - 8.5.2. Proven analytical and decision-making skills;
 - 8.5.3. Experience working on committees, boards, adjudicative bodies, task forces or similar settings;
 - 8.5.4. Experience in accounting and audit, law, law enforcement, academics, or municipal administration from related fields;
 - 8.5.5. Demonstrated knowledge of quasi-judicial proceedings;
 - 8.5.6. Availability and willingness to attend meetings; and,
 - 8.5.7. Excellent oral and written communication skills.

9. Meetings:

- 9.1. Meetings will occur, as needed, and shall be conducted in accordance with Clarington's Compliance Audit Committee Administrative Practices and Procedures.

10. Chair:

- 10.1. At the first meeting of a Compliance Audit Committee on a particular report or application, the members shall appoint one member to act as Chair for the Committee.

**2022 Municipal and School Board Election
Clarington Compliance Audit Committee
Terms of Reference**

11. Role of Clerk:

11.1. The Clerk will act as the main contact between the Committee, compliance audit applicant, candidate and registered third party. In accordance with section 88.37 (6) of the Act, the Clerk shall carry out any duties required under the Act to implement the Committee's decisions.

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

Preamble

In recognition of the provisions of Section 88.37 of the *Municipal Elections Act, 1996*, the Municipality of Clarington establishes a Joint Compliance Audit Committee.

In accordance with Section 88.37(6) of the Act, the following administrative practices and Procedures have been established for the 2022 Municipal Election Compliance Audit Committee to fulfill its duties in a fair, open and responsible manner.

1. Definitions

1.1. As used in these Procedures, the following terms and abbreviations will have the meanings indicated:

- a) “Act” means the *Municipal Elections Act, 1996*, S.O. 1996, c. 32, as amended from time to time;
- b) “Alternate Member” means a Member who is called upon to participate as a full voting member in one, or more, meetings of the Compliance Audit Committee in the event that a Member is absent or is unable to act as a Member at a scheduled meeting;
- c) “Applicant” means the Elector who submitted the Application requesting a Compliance Audit pursuant to Section 88.33(1) and 88.35(1) of the Act;
- d) “Application” means an application properly completed and submitted to the Clerk pursuant to Section 88.33(2) and 88.35(2) of the Act;
- e) “Auditor” means the person appointed by the Committee, licensed under the *Public Accounting Act, 2004*, to conduct a Compliance Audit of a Candidate’s election campaign finances pursuant to Section 88.33(10) and 88.33(11) of the Act;
- f) “Auditor’s Report” means a report of the Auditor regarding the findings of an audit into the election campaign finances of a Candidate or Registered Third Party Advertiser.
- g) “Candidate” means a person who submitted a nomination to run for elected office in accordance with the Act;
- h) “Chair” means the presiding officer for Committee Meetings, selected in accordance with these procedures;
- i) “Clerk” means the clerk of the Municipality, or their designate;

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- j) “Committee” means three Members selected to serve as the Compliance Audit Committee established by the municipality or local board pursuant to Section 88.37 of the Act and in accordance with the Compliance Audit Committee Terms of Reference adopted by the municipality;
- k) “Compliance Audit” means an audit of a Candidate or Third Party Advertiser’s election campaign finances conducted by an Auditor appointed by the Committee;
- l) “Contributor” means an individual, corporation, or trade union who has made contributions to the campaign of a Candidate or Registered Third Party Advertiser;
- m) “Council” means the Council of the Municipality of Clarington;
- n) “Elector” means a person eligible to vote in the municipal election in accordance with the Act;
- o) “Local Board” means a School Board;
- p) “MCIA” means the *Municipal Conflict of Interest Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. M.50*, as amended;
- q) “Meeting” means a Meeting of the Committee held under the Act;
- r) “MEA” means the *Municipal Elections Act, 1996, S.O. 1996, c. 32, Sched.*, as amended;
- s) “Member” means an individual who has been duly appointed in accordance with the Municipality’s appointment procedures, and selected by the Municipality to serve as the Compliance Audit Committee in accordance with the Compliance Audit Committee Terms of Reference;
- t) “Minutes” means the record, without note or comment, of the Committee’s resolutions and decisions;
- u) “Municipality” means the Municipality of Clarington;
- v) “Procedures” means this document in its entirety;
- w) “Prosecutor” means an individual selected for the purpose of prosecuting a Candidate, Registered Third Party Advertiser, or Contributor for contraventions of the election campaign finance provisions of the *MEA*;

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- x) “Report” means the Report prepared by the Clerk in accordance with Section 88.34 of the Act which identifies whether a Contributor appears to have contravened any of the contribution limits under the Act;
- y) “Third Party Advertiser” means the registered Third Party Advertiser whose election campaign finances are the subject of an Application for a Compliance Audit; and
- z) “Witness” means an individual or organization requested by an Applicant, Contributor, Candidate, or Third Party Advertiser to speak and/or present evidence at a Meeting.

2. Responsibilities

- 2.1. It is the responsibility of Members to fairly consider all Applications and Reports with respect to alleged and apparent contraventions of the financial provisions of the *MEA*, and to render decisions in accordance with their authorities under the *MEA*.
- 2.2. It is the responsibility of the Chair to:
 - a) Lead the Committee through the Order of Business at a meeting, until the consideration of all matters on the meeting agenda are complete;
 - b) Enforce the observance of order, decorum, and the rules of debate among the Members and those persons in attendance at a meeting;
 - c) Decide questions of order and procedure at a meeting, in consultation with the Clerk; and
 - d) Serve as a liaison between the Committee and the Clerk on matters of procedure and process.

3. Expected Conduct for Members & Conflicts of Interest

- 3.1. Members of the Compliance Audit Committee are expected to treat all Members, Applicants, Candidates, staff and members of the public with respect.
- 3.2. Members shall perform their functions with integrity, accountability, impartiality, and transparency, avoiding improper use of the influence of their appointment, conflicts of interest, or perceptions of bias.
- 3.3. Members shall perform their duties in a manner that promotes public confidence and will bear close public scrutiny.

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- 3.4. Members shall seek to serve the public interest by upholding both the letter and the spirit of the laws and the Terms of Reference and mandate of the Committee.
- 3.5. Members are responsible for determining if they are unable to uphold these standards with respect to a specific application and shall notify the Clerk immediately upon becoming aware.
- 3.6. While the Committee is not a local board for the purposes of the *MCIA* and is therefore not subject to the *MCIA*, Members are expected to adhere to the following principles enumerated in the *MCIA*:
 - a) The importance of integrity, independence and accountability in decision-making;
 - b) Members are expected to perform their duties of office with integrity and impartiality in a manner that will bear the closest scrutiny; and
 - c) There is a benefit to municipalities and local boards when members have a broad range of knowledge and continue to be active in their own communities, whether in business, in the practice of a profession, in community associations, and otherwise.
- 3.7. As noted in the Committee's Terms of Reference, "All Committee Members shall agree in writing that they will not work or volunteer for, or contribute to, any candidate or registered third party in any capacity in an election of a lower-tier municipality in the Region of Durham, the Regional Municipality of Durham, or a School Board having jurisdiction in the Region of Durham." If a Member is identified as having participated or contributed to a candidate's campaign or registered third party, that person shall not be eligible to be serve." Should an appointed Committee Member accept employment with the Municipality or register as a candidate or a third party with the Municipality, they will have been deemed to have resigned.
- 3.8. Members shall not participate in a Committee proceeding if they have a family, personal or business relationship with the Applicant or the subject of the application.
- 3.9. Where a Member cannot uphold the above principles, the Member shall notify the Clerk and shall be recused from participating in the applicable Committee proceedings. The Clerk shall be permitted to appoint an Alternate Member to act in the place of the recused Member in order to maintain the composition of three Members for the Committee.
- 4. Observance of Rules of Procedure**

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- 4.1. The rules in these Procedures shall be observed in all Meetings of the Committee.
- 4.2. If these Procedures do not provide for a matter of procedure that arises during a Meeting, the practice shall be determined by the Chair in consultation with the Clerk, and the Chair may do whatever is necessary and permitted by law to enable the Committee to effectively and completely deal with the matter before it.
- 4.3. The Committee may waive any rule of procedure as it considers appropriate by a two-thirds majority vote of Members, with the exception of any procedures that are mandated by the *MEA* or any other provincial legislation.
- 4.4. A Member may call attention to a violation of these procedures by stating a point of order to the Chair, and the Chair shall then decide upon the point of order and advise the Members of their decision with respect to the procedure to be followed. A Member may immediately appeal the Chair's decision to the Committee. The Committee shall hear the reason for the appeal from the appellant and the reason for the decision from the Chair and shall decide the question without debate. The decision of the Committee based on a majority vote is final.

5. Committee Composition

- 5.1. In accordance with the Compliance Audit Committee Terms of Reference, the Council shall appoint three Members to serve on the Committee and one alternate member.
- 5.2. Alternate members shall be paid a retainer and per meeting fee and shall attend all meetings in a non-voting capacity until called upon.
- 5.3. The Alternate Members will be called upon should a Member be unable to attend a Meeting for any reason or be recused from the Committee's proceedings per Section 3 of these Procedures.
- 5.4. When called upon to sit at a Committee meeting, an Alternate Member shall have all the same duties and powers as a regular Member and shall be properly briefed on all matters pertinent to the Committee's business.
- 5.5. Where an Alternate Member is sitting at a Committee meeting and the previously absent regular Member becomes available to participate, the regular Member shall not take the place of the Alternate Member and the Alternate Member shall continue to serve for the remainder of the meeting. Where a meeting, or matter of Committee business is adjourned to a later date, the Alternate Member shall

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

continue to participate at the future meeting in place of the regular Member until the matter is dispensed with and/or the meeting concludes.

6. Legal Counsel

- 6.1. Where the Clerk or Committee determines that the Committee requires legal assistance in respect of a specific Application or Report, or for other matters such as the Committee's role, interpretation of legislation, procedure, or other matters of a general nature pertinent to the Committee's business, the Clerk, in consultation with the Municipal Solicitor, shall retain legal counsel to provide advice that may be subject to solicitor client privilege to the Committee.

7. Duties of Chair and Members

7.1. Duties of the Chair

The Chair shall:

- a) Call Meetings to order;
- b) Facilitate discussion and identify the order of proceedings and speakers;
- c) Summarize discussion points and ensure all Members have an opportunity to be heard and understood;
- d) Put to vote all motions that are regularly moved and announce the result of the vote;
- e) Ensure all attendees of the Meeting are treated fairly and appropriately, ensuring order and decorum are observed;
- f) Liaise with the Clerk as required; and
- g) Serve as the Committee's principal spokesperson.

7.2. Duties of Members

All Members, including the Chair shall:

- a) Attend all Committee Meetings, and shall advise the Clerk as soon as possible if they are unable to attend a Committee Meeting;
- b) Understand their role, the Committee's mandate, and meeting procedures;

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- c) Declare if they cannot uphold the principles enumerated in Section 3 of these Procedures and be recused from participating in the applicable Committee proceedings;
- d) Participate as an active and voting Member, asking questions and seeking clarification through the Chair; and
- e) Develop and maintain a climate of mutual support, trust, courtesy and respect, working together to utilize the talent and knowledge of all Members.

8. Notice of Proceedings

- 8.1. As soon as possible following the receipt and acceptance of an Application by the Clerk or submission of a Report, the Clerk shall notify all affected parties and supply them with a copy of the Application or Report and publish notice of receipt of the Application or submission of the Report on the municipal website, including a copy of the Application or Report.
- 8.2. Notice of a scheduled Committee meeting shall be given by the Clerk to the affected parties and the public as soon as possible upon determination of the date, time and location of the meeting, with sufficient time to enable the affected parties to request a delegation and/or make a written submission prior to agenda publication. Such notice shall identify the time, place and purpose of the meeting, and the fact that if any party fails to attend the meeting, the Committee may still proceed in the party's absence and render a decision in relation to the matter.
- 8.3. In the case of an Application, the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser shall be requested to respond to the Application in writing. The written response must be submitted to the Clerk a minimum of three business days prior to the Meeting at which the Application will be considered.
- 8.4. In the case of a Clerk's Report, the applicable Candidate or Third Party Advertiser and the Contributor shall be requested to respond to the Report in writing. Each written response must be submitted to the Clerk a minimum of three business days prior to the Meeting at which the Report will be considered.
- 8.5. The Clerk shall distribute any written submissions received to Committee Members before or during a Meeting, including those of a Candidate or Third Party Advertiser and Contributor, in relation to an Application, Report, or other item on an agenda.
- 8.6. If a party fails to attend the Meeting, the Committee may proceed in the party's absence and the party will not be entitled to further notice in relation to the

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

Meeting or subsequent Meetings at which the Application or Report is considered.

- 8.7. A Meeting may be cancelled or postponed by the Clerk in consultation with the Chair when sufficient Members cannot attend, when a meeting is no longer required, or in the event of an emergency.
- 8.8. The Clerk shall give notice of Meeting cancellations or postponements by providing notice to Members as soon as possible prior to the scheduled Meeting and by posting a notice on the municipal website. In the event of an emergency, a cancellation notice shall be provided as soon as possible in a manner deemed appropriate by the Clerk.
- 8.9. The Clerk may provide earlier or additional forms of notice as the Clerk deems appropriate.

9. Meetings, Agendas & Electronic Participation

- 9.1. The Committee shall meet at the request of the Clerk. The Clerk shall request a Meeting of the Committee when required by the Act.
- 9.2. The presence of three Members at a Meeting shall constitute quorum for the purposes of these procedures.
- 9.3. Meetings of the Committee shall be held at a location the Clerk deems appropriate. Meetings may be held electronically, subject to the discretion of the Clerk and where permitted by the general meeting procedures and practices regarding electronic meetings established by the relevant Participating Body.
- 9.4. Committee Meetings shall commence at a time and date to be set by the Clerk and will be adjourned on a vote of the Committee.
- 9.5. In accordance with s. 88.33(5.1) of the Act, Meetings of the Committee shall be open to the public, but the Committee may deliberate in private. The Clerk shall attend the private deliberations for the purpose of recording minutes and providing procedural advice to the Committee, as requested.
- 9.6. The Clerk shall prepare an agenda for each Committee Meeting and publish it on the municipality website at least forty-eight hours prior to the scheduled meeting date and time. Failure to meet this publication deadline shall mean that the meeting cannot occur and shall be rescheduled.
- 9.7. The agenda shall include a copy of the Application(s) (including the reasons given) and/or Report(s), as well as any written submissions received from

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

Candidates, Third Party Advertisers, or Contributors in relation to the Applications or Reports under consideration at the meeting prior to the specified deadlines for submission to be included in the agenda.

10. Decorum at Meetings

- 10.1. Meeting attendees shall maintain order and shall not heckle or engage in conversations, display placards or props, or engage in any behaviour that may be considered disruptive to the meeting. The Chair shall have the right to expel any person for improper or disruptive conduct during a meeting.
- 10.2. Meeting attendees shall ensure that all personal digital devices are turned off or set to a silent mode during a meeting.
- 10.3. Meeting attendees may use cameras and/or recording, broadcasting or streaming devices respectfully during any meeting, provided that doing so is not disruptive to the meeting or to other attendees. Attendees using their own recording, broadcasting or streaming equipment are encouraged to inform the Clerk to ensure Committee Members and attendees at the meeting are notified. Use of any recording device during private deliberations is prohibited.
- 10.4. Where a Member considers that their integrity or the integrity of the Committee as a whole has been impugned, the Member may draw attention to the matter by declaring a point of privilege. The Chair shall make a decision on the validity of the point of privilege and, if in agreement, may seek a resolution (i.e. apology, warning, expulsion from meeting, etc.) from any individual that impugned the integrity of a Member or the Committee as a whole. A Member may immediately appeal the Chair's decision on a point of privilege to the Committee. The Committee shall hear the reason for the appeal from the appellant and the reason for the decision from the Chair and shall decide the question without debate. The decision of the Committee by majority vote is final.

11. Rules of Debate & Evidence

- 11.1. The following principles govern the rules of deliberation at meetings of the Committee:
 - a) The majority of Members have the right to decide;
 - b) The minority of Members have the right to be heard;
 - c) All Members have the right to information to help make decisions, unless otherwise prevented by law;

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- d) All Members have the right to an efficient meeting;
 - e) All Members have the right to be treated with respect and courtesy; and
 - f) All Members have equal rights, privileges and obligations.
- 11.2. When two, or more, Committee Members wish to speak, the Chair shall determine the order of speakers based on who requested to speak first.
- 11.3. A Committee Member may ask a question only for the purpose of obtaining information relating to the matter under discussion.
- 11.4. A Committee Member may ask a question only of:
- a) The Clerk;
 - b) A Member who has already spoken on the matter under discussion;
 - c) The Chair;
 - d) An official of the Participating Body;
 - e) A Witness;
 - f) Legal counsel appointed to provide advice to the Committee; and
 - g) Any other person addressing the Committee pursuant to these Procedures.
- 11.5. Any Member may propose a motion on the matter under consideration. Members are encouraged to provide the motion to the Clerk in writing, where possible. A seconder is not required in order to put a motion on the floor.
- 11.6. The following motions are deemed to be procedural in nature, are not required to be provided in writing, and shall be subject to consideration in the following order:
- a) To change the order of business (not debatable);
 - b) To adjourn, and amendments thereto (not debatable);
 - c) That the vote be now taken (not debatable); and
 - d) To defer a matter.

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- 11.7. Applicants, Candidates, Third Party Advertisers, Contributors and/or their agents shall submit all written statements and documentary evidence to the Clerk a minimum of three business days prior to the meeting, to ensure its publication in the agenda for the meeting.
- 11.8. Notwithstanding subsection 11.7, a Candidate, Third Party Advertiser, Applicant, Contributor and/or their agents are entitled to submit additional information and evidence to the Committee at any time prior to the Committee rendering its decision with respect to the Application or Report under consideration, including at a Meeting. Committee Members are entitled to receive additional information and evidence and may determine whether such additional information and evidence will be considered in the course of their deliberations. In considering additional information and evidence, the Committee shall have regard for whether the introduction of the additional information and evidence may create a procedural unfairness towards any of the involved parties. If the Committee determines that a procedural unfairness would be caused by considering the additional evidence submitted, the Committee may at its discretion exclude the consideration of that evidence from its deliberations. Should the Committee decide to accept any additional information or evidence, it shall afford all parties an opportunity to respond to the additional information or evidence provided.
- 11.9. Applicants, Candidates, Third Party Advertisers, Contributors and/or their agents are permitted to invite Witnesses to Meetings, and such Witnesses may make delegations to the Committee and/or submit additional information and evidence in their possession to the Committee, in accordance with the rules set out in subsection 11.7 and 11.8. Applicants, Candidates, Third Party Advertisers, Contributors and/or their agents are encouraged to advise the Clerk before the Meeting of their intention to invite any Witnesses and shall provide the full name of any Witnesses to the Clerk.

12. Voting

- 12.1. Every Committee Member present at a Meeting of the Committee when a question is put shall vote on the question, unless the Member is recused in accordance with Section 3 of these Procedures or is otherwise prohibited by law from voting. If a Member refuses to vote, their vote is deemed to be in the negative and shall be recorded as such.
- 12.2. All motions of the Committee shall require a majority vote by the Members to be adopted. In the event of a tie, the motion shall be deemed to have been lost. The Chair shall announce the result of every vote.
- 12.3. A recorded vote may be held at the request of any Member and shall be administered by the Clerk.

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- 12.4. A motion containing distinct proposals shall be divided upon request by any Member, and in such cases each proposal shall be voted on separately.
- 12.5. A motion to amend shall relate to the subject matter of the main motion, shall not be received if it poses a direct negative to the question, and shall be put to vote in reverse order in which the amendments are made. Only a motion to amend an amendment to the original motion shall be allowed and any further amendments must be made to the original motion.
- 12.6. A motion to recess shall provide for the Committee to take an intermission, for an expressly stated period, within a Meeting which shall neither end the meeting nor destroy its continuity, and after which proceedings shall immediately resume at the point where they were interrupted.

13. Order of Business at Meetings

13.1. Call to Order

The Chair shall call the meeting to order once all members of the Committee selected from the roster are present at, or after, the scheduled start time for the meeting. If there is no Chair currently appointed, the Clerk shall call the meeting to order and request that members move and adopt a motion to appoint a Chair.

13.2. Appointment of a Chair

At the first meeting of a Compliance Audit Committee on a particular report or application, the Members shall appoint one member to act as Chair for the duration of the Committee's deliberations on those matters on the agenda. The Chair shall retain the role for all matters. Another Member may assume the Chair if the selected Chair is unable to fulfill their duties.

13.3. Opening Statement

The Chair shall make an opening statement outlining the procedure and format for the Committee Meeting. The Clerk may introduce the Committee Members for the benefit of the public.

13.4. Preliminary Motions

Following the opening statement and before considering the substance of agenda items, Members may make preliminary motions with respect to any business properly before the Committee, including motions to change the order of business, defer an agenda item, etc.

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

13.5. Consideration of Application or Clerk's Report

The Committee shall receive, and consider, all presentations, delegations, written submissions, and reports related to an Application or Clerk's Report, in the following order:

- a) Presentations by Staff – Presentations shall only be permitted from an appointed Auditor, legal counsel for the Committee, a trainer, or the Clerk. There shall be no time limit for presentations, however, presenters are encouraged to be brief and concise.
- b) Delegations – A Candidate, Third Party Advertiser, Contributor for a Report, and a Candidate, Third Party Advertiser, Contributor or Applicant for an Application, or their agent or a Witness, may appear as a delegation at such time as the Report or Application for which the person received notice is considered. Authorized individuals that wish to address the Committee as a delegate shall register with the Clerk not later than noon on the business day prior to the Committee Meeting. A delegate shall be permitted to speak to the item for up to ten minutes, following which Members may then ask questions of the delegate.
- c) Deliberation – The Committee shall consider all the information presented and render a decision on the matter before it. The Committee may adjourn to a later date to seek more information and continue deliberations as necessary.

14. Review of Contributions by Clerk & Associated Reports

- 14.1. The Clerk is responsible for reviewing contributions reported on the financial statements submitted by Candidates and Third Party Advertisers in accordance with Section 88.34 and 88.36 of the Act to determine whether any Contributor appears to have exceeded any of the contribution limits specified in the Act.
- 14.2. The Clerk shall prepare a Report that identifies each Contributor to a Candidate or Third Party Advertiser who appears to have contravened any of the contribution limits, and such Report shall be prepared as soon as possible following the day that is thirty days after the filing date, or supplementary filing date, for the relevant financial statement. If the Contributor's total contributions to a Candidate or Third Party Advertiser appear to exceed the limit, the Report shall set out the contributions made by that Contributor to the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser. If the Contributor's total contributions to two, or more, Third Party Advertisers or Candidates for office on the same Council or local board appear to exceed the aggregate limit, the Report shall set out the contributions made by that Contributor to all Third Party Advertisers in relation to Third Party

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

Advertisements, or to all Candidates for office on the Council or local board. A separate Report shall be prepared by the Clerk for each Contributor. The Clerk shall then forward the Report to the Committee and the Contributor.

- 14.3. Within thirty days of receiving the Report, the Committee shall consider the Report and decide whether to commence a legal proceeding against a Contributor for an apparent contravention. The Committee shall meet at least once to consider the Report and render a decision. The Committee may adjourn and meet again at its discretion within the thirty day time limitation, if required.
- 14.4. Upon deciding whether, or not, to begin a prosecution in respect of a Report, the Committee shall provide written reasons for its decision. If written reasons are not prepared and presented at the meeting, the Committee shall provide brief oral reasons for its decision at the meeting, followed by the preparation and release of written reasons for its decision at a later date in accordance with these procedures.
- 14.5. Notwithstanding sections 14.2 and 14.3 of these Procedures, where the Clerk does not identify any Contributors who appear to have contravened any of the contribution limits specified in the Act, the Clerk may prepare a Report indicating that no apparent contraventions were identified, and may post a copy of the Report to the municipal website and forward a copy to the Roster of potential Members for their information.

15. Applications for a Compliance Audit

- 15.1. An Elector who is entitled to vote in an election and believes on reasonable grounds that a Candidate or Third Party Advertiser has contravened a provision of the Act relating to election campaign finances may apply to the Committee for a Compliance Audit of the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser's election campaign finances, even if the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser has not filed a financial statement under Section 88.25 of the Act.
- 15.2. An Application for a Compliance Audit shall be made to the Clerk. The Application shall set out the reasons for the Elector's belief that the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser has contravened the Act.
- 15.3. The Application must be made within ninety days after the latest of:
 - a) The filing date under Section 88.30 of the Act;
 - b) The Candidate or Third Party Advertiser's supplementary filing date, if any, under Section 88.30 of the Act;

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- c) The date the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser filed a financial statement, if the statement was filed within 30 days after the applicable filing date under Section 88.30; or
 - d) The date on which the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser's extension, if any, under s. 88.23(6) and s. 88.27(3) of the Act expires.
- 15.4. Within ten days after receiving the Application, the Clerk shall forward the Application to Committee Members requesting their availability to meet within thirty days. Members shall respond within two business days by e-mail and/or phone. The Committee shall meet at least once to consider the Application and render a decision with respect to whether to grant the Application and appoint an Auditor. The Committee may adjourn and meet again at its discretion within the thirty day time limitation, if required.
- 15.5. Upon deciding whether, or not, to grant the Application and appoint an Auditor, the Committee shall provide written reasons for its decision. If written reasons are not prepared and presented at the meeting, the Committee shall provide brief oral reasons for its decision at the meeting, followed by the preparation and release of written reasons for its decision at a later date in accordance with these procedures.
- 16. Auditors & Prosecutors**
- 16.1. If the Committee decides to grant an Application, it shall appoint an Auditor licensed under the *Public Accounting Act, 2004*, to conduct a Compliance Audit of the Candidate's election campaign finances. The Clerk may provide a list of one or more qualified Auditor(s) to perform the audit, however the Committee is entitled to appoint any qualified Auditor that it so chooses, so long as the chosen Auditor is not a member of the Committee. The Committee may appoint an Auditor at the meeting or may do so outside of a formal Committee Meeting.
- 16.2. The Auditor shall promptly conduct an audit of the Candidate's or Third Party Advertiser's election campaign finances to determine whether they have complied with the provisions of the *MEA* relating to election campaign finances.
- 16.3. The Auditor shall have all the powers as set out in Section 88.33(15) of the *MEA*. When conducting the audit, the Auditor shall have regard for the material facts, information, and evidence presented at the meeting wherein the compliance audit was ordered. However, the Auditor may, in accordance with their powers under the *MEA*, request additional documentation and examine any other aspects of the relevant financial statements that they may deem relevant to the compliance audit, in order to determine if a contravention of the provisions of the *MEA* relating to election campaign finances occurred.

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

- 16.4. Upon completing the compliance audit, the Auditor shall prepare an Auditor's Report outlining any apparent contraventions of the election campaign finance provisions of the *MEA* and submit it to the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser, the Applicant, and the Clerk.
- 16.5. In accordance with s. 88.33(14) of the *MEA*, within ten days of receiving the Auditor's Report, the Clerk shall distribute the report to all Committee Members.
- 16.6. The Committee shall consider the Auditor's Report within thirty days of receiving it and, if the report concludes that the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser appears to have contravened a provision of the *MEA* relating to election campaign finances, the Committee shall decide whether to commence a legal proceeding against the Candidate or Third Party Advertiser. The Committee shall meet at least once to consider the Auditor's Report and render a decision. The Committee may adjourn and meet again at its discretion within the thirty day time limitation, if required.
- 16.7. Upon deciding whether to commence a legal proceeding in respect of an Auditor's Report, the Committee shall provide written reasons for its decision. If written reasons are not prepared and presented at the meeting, the Committee shall provide brief oral reasons for its decision at the meeting, followed by the preparation and release of written reasons for its decision at a later date in accordance with these procedures.
- 16.8. The Clerk may provide a Prosecutor, or alternatively the Clerk may provide a list of one or more qualified Prosecutor(s) to the Committee to select for the purposes of engaging in legal proceedings (however the Committee is entitled to appoint any qualified prosecutor that it so chooses). The chosen Prosecutor shall not be a member of the Committee. The Prosecutor may be selected at the meeting or may be selected outside of a formal Committee Meeting.

17. Written Reasons

- 17.1. Where the Committee is required to provide written reasons for a decision, Committee Members may, but are not required to, present their written reasons at the meeting where the decision was made. Where written reasons are not provided at the meeting, the Committee shall submit their written reasons to the Clerk no later than seven days after the meeting at which the decision was made.
- 17.2. The Clerk may provide the Committee with general assistance regarding the development of written reasons and may provide templates or examples. However, the Clerk shall not offer comment or advice on the substance of written reasons. If legal advice or assistance is required for the development and

**2022 Clarington Municipal Elections
Compliance Audit Committee
Administrative Practices and Procedures**

drafting of reasons, the Committee may engage the services of a solicitor in accordance with these Procedures.

- 17.3. As soon as possible after receiving the Committee's completed written reasons, the Clerk shall distribute the written reasons to all affected parties and publish them on the municipal website.

18. Minutes & Public Records

- 18.1. The Clerk shall prepare Minutes for each Meeting and post a copy of the open session portion of the Minutes on the municipal website. All posted minutes shall be considered final.
- 18.2. Agendas, Minutes, Applications, Clerk's Reports, and evidence submitted to the Committee are public records, and all personal information collected, maintained, and disclosed on such records is done so with the express intent of creating a record that is available to the general public in accordance with section 27 of the *Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*. Records of private deliberations held in the absence of the public shall not be disclosed, unless required by law.
- 18.3. The Clerk may, at their discretion redact personal information from public records of the Committee but is not required to do so.
- 18.4. The Clerk is authorized to make administrative corrections to official records of Committee business, and in such cases the Clerk shall document any corrections made to ensure their conformity with the direction provided by the Committee and any relevant governing legislation.