

# Clarington

## Council

## Agenda

Date: February 4, 2019

Time: 7:00 PM

Place: Council Chambers, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
Municipal Administrative Centre  
40 Temperance Street  
Bowmanville, Ontario



**Inquiries & Accommodations:** For inquiries about this agenda, or to make arrangements for accessibility accommodations for persons attending, please contact: Michelle Chambers, Administrative Assistant to the Clerk, at 905-623-3379, ext. 2101 or by email at [mchambers@clarington.net](mailto:mchambers@clarington.net).

**Alternate Format:** If this information is required in an alternate format, please contact the Accessibility Coordinator, at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131.

**Audio Record:** The Municipality of Clarington makes an audio record of Council meetings. If you make a delegation or presentation at a Council meeting, the Municipality will be audio recording you and will make the recording public by publishing the recording on the Municipality's website. In addition, please be advised that some of the Council meetings may be video recorded.

**Cell Phones:** Please ensure all cell phones, mobile and other electronic devices are turned off or placed on non-audible mode during the meeting.

Copies of Reports are available at [www.clarington.net](http://www.clarington.net)

1 Call to Order

2 Moment of Reflection

3 Declaration of Interest

4 Announcements

5 Adoption of Minutes of Previous Meeting(s)

- 5.1 Council Minutes      Minutes of a regular meeting of Council January 14, 2019      Page 5  
January 14, 2019

6 Presentations

There are no Presentations scheduled for this meeting as of the time of publication.

7 Delegations

- 7.1 Linda Gasser, regarding Report PSD-010-19, Resolution regarding Durham Region's Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study Report #2019-COW-3 PLN 33.3.10 (Agenda Item 13.2)

8 Communications – Receive for Information

There are no Communications to be received for information as of the time of publication.

9 Communications – Direction

There are no Communications for direction as of the time of publication.

10 Committee Reports

10.1 Advisory Committee Reports

- 10.1.1 Newcastle      Minutes of the Newcastle Arena Board dated November 13,      Page 19  
Arena Board      2018  
Minutes

10.1.2	Agricultural Advisory Committee Minutes	Minutes of the Agricultural Advisory Committee dated January 10, 2019	Page 21
10.1.3	Heritage Committee Minutes	Minutes of the Clarington Heritage Committee dated January 15, 2019	Page 24
10.1.4	Active Transportation and Safe Roads Committee Minutes	Minutes of the Active Transportation and Safe Roads Advisory Committee dated January 17, 2019	Page 27
10.2	General Government Committee	General Government Committee Report of January 21, 2019	Page 33
10.3	Planning & Development Committee	Planning and Development Committee Report of January 28, 2019	Page 37

## 11 Staff Reports

11.1 Confidential Verbal Report from the Director of Operations, regarding a Municipal Facility concerning information specifically supplied to the Municipality by the Federal Government

## 12 Business Arising from Procedural Notice of Motion

## 13 Unfinished Business

13.1	Strategic Initiatives Officer	Fulfilling a Role of the Strategic Initiatives Officer [Referred from the January 14, 2019 Council Meeting]
------	----------------------------------	--

13.2 Report  
PSD-010-19

Resolution regarding Durham Region's Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study Report #2019-COW-3 PLN 33.3.10 [Referred from the January 28, 2019 Planning and Development Committee Meeting]

13.3 Report  
COD-002-19

Miscellaneous Catch Basin and Maintenance Hole Repairs [Referred at the January 21, 2019 General Government Committee Meeting]

[Link to  
COD-002-19](#)

## 14 By-laws

14.1 2019-005

Being a By-law to exempt a certain portion of Registered Plan 10M-840 from Part Lot Control

Page 38

14.2 2019-006

Being a By-law to exempt a certain portion of Registered Plan 40M-2629 and 40M-2602 from Part Lot Control

Page 40

14.3 2019-007

Being a By-law to establish certain lands as Public Highways  
(Item 8 of General Government Committee Report)

## 15 Procedural Notices of Motion

## 16 Other Business

## 17 Confirming By-Law

## 18 Adjournment

If this information is required in an alternate format, please contact the Accessibility Co-ordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131

Minutes of a regular meeting of Council held on January 14, 2019, at 7:00 PM, in the Council Chambers.

Present Were: Mayor A. Foster, Councillor G. Anderson, Councillor R. Hooper, Councillor J. Jones, Councillor J. Neal, Councillor C. Traill, Councillor M. Zwart

Staff Present: A. Allison, R. Albright, C. Carr, J. Caruana until 9:50 PM, F. Horvath until 9:50 PM, F. Langmaid, M. Marano until 9:50 PM, R. Maciver, G. Weir until 9:50 PM, A. Greentree, M. Chambers

## 1 Call to Order

Mayor Foster called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM.

## 2 Moment of Reflection

Councillor Jones led the meeting in a moment of reflection.

## 3 Declaration of Interest

There were no disclosures of interest stated at this meeting.

## 4 Announcements

Members of Council announced upcoming community events and matters of community interest.

## 5 Adoption of Minutes of Previous Meeting

Resolution #C-001-19

Moved by Councillor Traill seconded by Councillor Zwart

That the minutes of the regular meeting of the Council held on December 17, 2018, be approved.

Carried

## 6 Presentations

### 6.1 Rose Rockbrune, Board Member and Brad Carter, Acting Manager of Strategic Planning, Durham Regional Police Service Board, Regarding the Durham Regional Police Service 2020-2022 Strategic Business Plan

Rose Rockbrune, Board Member and Brad Carter, Acting Manager of Strategic Planning, Durham Regional Police Service Board were present regarding the Durham Regional Police Service 2020-2022 Strategic Business Plan. They made a verbal presentation to accompany an electronic presentation. Mr. Carter explained that the Region of Durham is a safe community in comparison to other larger municipalities in Ontario. He noted that the public consultation will assist in establishing objectives and performance measures for the Strategic Plan. Mr. Carter provided an overview of the public consultation which included an online survey at [www.drps.ca](http://www.drps.ca), attending public events, meetings with stakeholders and attending the Municipalities in the Region of Durham. Mr. Carter concluded by asking Members of Council what their priorities are and if they have any questions or input for the Strategic Business Plan. Mr. Carter and Ms. Rockbrune answered questions from members of Council. Concerns raised by Members of Council included: road safety, speeding, cannabis, mental health, and human trafficking.

#### **Suspend the Rules**

Resolution #C-002-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That the Rules of Procedure be suspended to allow Members of Council to ask questions of Ms. Rockbrune and Mr. Carter, a second time.

Carried

Resolution #C-003-19

Moved by Councillor Anderson, seconded by Councillor Hooper

That the presentation of Rose Rockbrune, Board Member and Brad Carter, Acting Manager of Strategic Planning, Durham Regional Police Service Board regarding the Durham Regional Police Service 2020 2022 Strategic Business Plan, be received with thanks; and

That Members of Council, Staff, and residents be encouraged to complete the online survey.

Carried

## **6.2 George Rocoski, Chair, Energy From Waste-Waste Management Advisory Committee, Regarding the Energy From Waste – Waste Management Advisory Committee Annual Update**

George Rocoski, Chair, Energy From Waste-Waste Management Advisory Committee was present regarding the Energy From Waste - Waste Management Advisory Committee Annual Update. He made a verbal presentation to accompany an electronic presentation. Mr. Rocoski reviewed the current Committee members and provided an update on the current Committee. He noted that typically the Committee meets four times per year and he reviewed the topics discussed at the three meetings held in 2018. Mr. Rocoski reviewed the 2018 Events including compost give-away, waste and electronics collection, and hazardous waste collection. He noted there was discussion at the last meeting regarding the next term of the Committee and reviewed the 2019 anticipated areas of interest for the Committee. Mr. Rocoski answered questions from the Members of Council.

Resolution #C-004-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Jones

That the presentation from George Rocoski, Chair, Energy From Waste-Waste Management Advisory Committee regarding the Energy From Waste - Waste Management Advisory Committee Annual Update, be received with thanks.

Carried

## **7 Delegations**

There are no Delegations scheduled for this meeting.

## **8 Communications – Receive for Information**

There were no communications to be received for information.

## **9 Communications – Direction**

**9.1 Rudy Kraayvanger regarding Report PSD-005-19, Option to Opt-out of Private Cannabis Retail Stores**

**9.2 Laurie Cook regarding Report PSD-005-19, Option to Opt-out of Private Cannabis Retail Stores**

**9.3 Dave Quantrill regarding Report PSD-005-19, Option to Opt-out of Private Cannabis Retail Store**

## **9.4 Rona Rigotti regarding Report PSD-005-19, Option to Opt-out of Private Cannabis Retail Stores**

Resolution #C-005-19

Moved by Councillor Jones, seconded by Councillor Hooper

That Correspondence Items 9.1 to 9.4, regarding Report PSD-005-19, Option to Opt-out of Private Cannabis Retail Stores, be referred to the consideration of Report PSD 005 19 (Agenda Item 13.2).

Carried

## **10 Committee Reports**

10.1 Agricultural  
Advisory  
Committee  
Minutes      Minutes of the Agricultural Advisory Committee dated  
December 13, 2018

10.2 Heritage  
Committee      Minutes of the Clarington Heritage Committee dated  
November 20, 2018

Resolution #C-006-19

Moved by Councillor Zwart, seconded by Councillor Traill

That Advisory Committee Report Items 10.1.1 and 10.1.2, be approved.

Carried

## **10.2 Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Report of January 7, 2019**

Resolution #C-007-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That the recommendations contained in the Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Report of January 7, 2019, be approved, on consent, with the exception of items #13, #2 and #9b, and #9h.

Carried

## **Item 2 – Correspondence from Michael Angemeer, President and CEO, Veridian, Regarding Director Re-Appointments**

Resolution #C-008-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill



That the process detailed in the January 11, 2019 memorandum from the Solicitor and Municipal Clerk be followed for Clarington's nominees to Veridian Board and Veridian Connections;

That the consultant retained by Veridian, to conduct interviews and prepare a findings report, be requested to attend the February 25, 2019 Council meeting to present his/her report in closed session;

That the appointments be completed no later than March 31, 2019; and

That all interested parties be advised of Council's decision.

Carried

### **Item 13 – Fulfilling a Role of the Strategic Initiatives Officer**

Resolution #C-009-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Hooper

That the matter of Fulfilling a Role of the Strategic Initiatives Officer be referred to the February 4, 2019 Council meeting.

Carried.

### **Items 9b & 9h – Report CLD-001-19 - Appointments to Various Boards & Committees – 2019-2022**

Resolution #C-010-19

Moved by Councillor Jones, seconded by Councillor Neal

That Council consider the applicants for appointments to the Agricultural Advisory Committee and Museum and Archives Board, and that the vote be conducted to appoint the citizen representatives in accordance to the Appointments to Boards and Committees Policy.

Carried

### **Recess**

Resolution #C-011-19

Moved by Councillor Jones, seconded by Councillor Neal

That Council recess for five minutes.

Carried

The meeting reconvened at 8:19 PM.

## **Items 9b & 9h– Report CLD-001-19 - Appointments to Various Boards & Committees – 2019-2022 - Continued**

Resolution #C-012-19

Moved by Councillor Jones, seconded by Councillor Neal

That the application from Jennifer Knox for appointment to the Clarington Agricultural Committee be added to the list of applicants to be considered for appointment.

Carried

### **Agricultural Advisory Committee**

The following individuals were appointed to the Agricultural Advisory Committee for a term ending December 31, 2022 or until a successor is appointed:

Tom Barrie  
Eric Bowman  
John Cartwright  
Jennifer Knox  
Donald Rickard

### **Museums and Archives Board**

The following individuals were appointed to the Museums and Archives Board for a term ending December 31, 2022 or until a successor is appointed:

Stephen Middleton  
Marilyn Morawetz  
Suzanne Reiner  
Marina Ross  
Katherine Warren

## **11 Staff Reports**

### **11.1 Confidential Report PSD-007-19 – Potential Property Acquisition**

#### **Alter the Agenda**

Resolution #C-013-19

Moved by Councillor Neal seconded by Councillor Traill

That the Agenda be altered to consider Confidential Report PSD-007-19, Potential Property Acquisition, later in the meeting.

Carried

## 12 Business Arising from Procedural Notice of Motion

None

## 13 Unfinished Business

### **13.1 Report CAO-001-19 - Update Regarding Municipal Climate Change Action (Referred from the January 7, 2019 Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Meeting)**

Resolution #C-014-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That Report CAO-001-19 be received for information.

Lost on the following recorded vote:

Council Member	Yes	No	Declaration of Interest	Absent
Councillor Neal	X			
Councillor Traill	X			
Councillor Zwart		X		
Councillor Anderson		X		
Councillor Hooper		X		
Councillor Jones		X		
Mayor Foster		X		

Resolution #C-015-19

Moved by Councillor Hooper, seconded by Councillor Zwart

That Report CAO-001-19 be received;

That pre-budget approval of the Municipality's financial contribution in 2019 of \$33,748 for the hiring of a Climate Change Coordinator be approved with \$15,000 of funding from the Municipal Government Enterprise Reserve Fund and \$18,748 of funding from the 2019 tax levy;

That pre-budget approval for the Municipality's financial contribution in 2020 of \$35,419 for the hiring of a Climate Change Coordinator be approved with funding from the 2020 tax levy;

That the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to execute the necessary agreements with the Federation of Canadian Municipalities; and

That all interested parties listed in Report CAO-001-19 and any delegations be advised of Council's decision by the Department.

Carried on the following recorded vote:

Council Member	Yes	No	Declaration of Interest	Absent
Councillor Neal		X		
Councillor Traill		X		
Councillor Zwart	X			
Councillor Anderson	X			
Councillor Hooper	X			
Councillor Jones	X			
Mayor Foster	X			

### **13.2 Report PSD-005-19 - Option to Opt-out of Private Cannabis Retail Stores (Referred from the January 7, 2019 Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Meeting)**

Resolution #C-016-19

Moved by Councillor Traill, seconded by Councillor Zwart

That Report PSD-005-19 be received;

That the Municipality of Clarington advise the AGCO that it opts-in to allow retail sales of recreational cannabis within the Municipality of Clarington; and

That Staff be directed to draft a Municipal Cannabis Retail Policy Statement for Council's consideration for consideration at the March 11, 2019 Planning and Development Committee Meeting; and

That the Region of Durham be advised of the Municipality of Clarington's decision with respect to the retail sales of recreational cannabis.

Carried Later in the Meeting  
(See following motions)

### **Suspend the Rules**

Resolution #C-017-19

Moved by Councillor Anderson, seconded by Councillor Traill

That the Rules of Procedure be suspended to allow Members of Council to speak to the matter of the foregoing Resolution #C-016-19 a second time.

Carried

The foregoing Resolution #C-016-19 was then carried on the following recorded vote:

Council Member	Yes	No	Declaration of Interest	Absent
Councillor Traill	X			
Councillor Zwart	X			
Councillor Anderson		X		
Councillor Hooper		X		
Councillor Jones	X			
Councillor Neal		X		
Mayor Foster	X			

## **Recess**

Resolution #C-018-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That Council recess for five minutes.

Carried

The meeting reconvened at 9:05 PM.

## **13.3 Report COD-001-19 - Health Benefit Program Renewal & ASO Considerations (Referred from the January 7, 2019 Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Meeting)**

Resolution #C-019-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That Report COD-001-19 be received;

That the presentation by DJ Nascimento from Mosey & Mosey Benefit Plan Consultants outlining the Health Benefit Program renewal and ASO consideration, be received with thanks;

That the recommendation by Mosey & Mosey to remain under the Insured Funded Arrangement (also referred to as non-refunded accounted arrangement) with Sun Life be approved until October 31, 2019 as outlined in the presentation and executive summary;

That the Director of Corporate Services be authorized to sign the appointment letter with Mosey & Mosey to renew the Benefit Program with Sun Life through the Local Authority Services (LAS) under either option of Insured Funded or ASO, as decided by Council provided that Mosey and Mosey shall certify that they are not receiving a retention bonus or retention payment from Sun Life;

That DJ Nascimento of Mosey & Mosey be advised of Council decision; and

That Staff report back to General Government Committee as soon as possible after September, 2019 on options for renewal, including ASO.

Carried

**13.4 Report CLD-005-19 - Response to Questions regarding Internet/Telephone Voting Methods of Election (Referred from the January 7, 2019 Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Meeting)**

Resolution #C-020-19

Moved by Councillor Traill, seconded by Councillor Jones

That Report CLD-005-19 be received;

That the Council of the Municipality of Clarington endorse Internet and Telephone Voting for Advance Polls and Voting Day as the preferred method of voting for the Municipality of Clarington, beginning with the 2022 Municipal Elections; and

That Attachment 1 to Report CLD-005-19, the draft by-law to authorize the use of internet and telephone voting, and to repeal By-law 2013-038 (which authorizes the use of vote tabulators, special ballots, and accessible equipment for Municipal Elections), be approved.

Carried on the following recorded vote:

Council Member	Yes	No	Declaration of Interest	Absent
Councillor Neal		X		
Councillor Traill	X			
Councillor Zwart		X		
Councillor Anderson	X			
Councillor Hooper		X		
Councillor Jones	X			
Mayor Foster	X			

**13.5 Memo regarding Correspondence Item 9.3 regarding Newcastle BIA request for Reserve Funds (Referred from the January 7, 2019 Joint General Government and Planning and Development Committees Meeting)**

Resolution #C-021-19

Moved by Councillor Zwart, seconded by Councillor Anderson

Whereas The Newcastle BIA has requested funds via letter dated December 20, 2018 for funding of over-the street banners from the Newcastle BIA Reserve Fund established with monies received from the "Bowmanville West End Development"; and

Whereas Council considers it appropriate to cover the \$10,000 request for banners; and

Whereas the banner poles on which these banners will be installed were requested by the Newcastle BIA as part of the streetscape work for which they agreed to pay;

Now therefore be it resolved that Council approves the request of \$28,454.84 from the Newcastle BIA Reserve Fund with \$10,000 going to the Newcastle BIA and remainder going to Engineering for the works they have had carried out, under Capital Project, Newcastle Streetscaping Improvements 110-32-338-83436.

Carried

## 14 By-laws

Resolution #C-023-19

Moved by Councillor Hooper, seconded by Councillor Anderson

That leave be granted to introduce By-laws 2019-001 to 2019-003

- |               |  |
|---------------|--|
| 14.1 2019-001 | Being a By-law to exempt a certain portion of Registered Plan 40M-2615 from Part Lot Control   |
| 14.2 2019-002 | Being a by-law to authorize the borrowing of \$15,000,000 to meet, until the taxes are collected, the current expenditures of the Municipality for the year 2019 (Item 12 of Joint General Government and Development Committees Report) |
| 14.3 2019-003 | Being a By-law to Authorize the Use of Internet Voting Equipment at Municipal Elections (Unfinished Business Item 13.5 Report CLD-005-19)  |

That the said by-laws be approved.

Carried Later in the Meeting  
(See following motions)

## **Recess**

Resolution #C-022-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That Council recess for five minutes.

Carried

The meeting reconvened at 9:50 PM.

The foregoing Resolution #C-023-19 was then put to a vote and carried.

## **15 Procedural Notices of Motion**

There were no Procedural Notices of Motion introduced under this Section of the Agenda.

### **11.1 Confidential Report PSD-007-19 – Potential Property Acquisition**

#### **Closed Session**

Resolution #C-024-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Traill

That, in accordance with Section 239 (2) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, the meeting be closed for the purpose of discussing a proposed or pending acquisition or disposition of land by the municipality or local board.

Carried

#### **Rise and Report**

The meeting resumed in open session at 9:57 PM with Mayor Foster in the Chair.

Mayor Foster advised that one item was discussed in “closed” session in accordance with Section 239(2) of the *Municipal Act, 2001* and no resolutions were passed.

#### **Closed Session**

Resolution #C-025-19

Moved by Councillor Neal, seconded by Councillor Jones

That, in accordance with Section 239 (2) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, the meeting be closed for the purpose of discussing a proposed or pending acquisition or disposition of land by the municipality or local board.

Carried



## Rise and Report

The meeting resumed in open session at 10:07 PM with Mayor Foster in the Chair.

Mayor Foster advised that one item was discussed in “closed” session in accordance with Section 239(2) of the *Municipal Act, 2001* and no resolutions were passed.

Resolution #C-026-19

Moved by Councillor Traill, seconded by Councillor Hooper

That Report PSD-007-19 be received;

That Council ratify the Offer to Purchase to Chris and Shona Townsend in the amount of \$500,000 for the property identified as 67 West Beach Road, Bowmanville, Ontario;

That the funds for the purchase of the property and any associated costs, be charged to the Land Acquisition Account 110-50-130-85002-7401;

That Mayor and the Clerk, be authorized to execute the Agreements to acquire the property; and

That Staff be directed to take all necessary actions to complete the transaction.

Carried on the following recorded vote:

Council Member	Yes	No	Declaration of Interest	Absent
Councillor Neal		X		
Councillor Traill	X			
Councillor Zwart	X			
Councillor Anderson	X			
Councillor Hooper	X			
Councillor Jones		X		
Mayor Foster	X			

## 16 Other Business

None

## 17 Confirming By-Law

Resolution #C-027-19

Moved by Councillor Hooper, seconded by Councillor Anderson

That leave be granted to introduce By-law 2019-004, being a by-law to confirm the proceedings of the Council of the Municipality of Clarington at a regular meeting held on the 14<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2019; and

That the said by-law be approved.

Carried

## 18 Adjournment

Resolution #C-028-19

Moved by Councillor Traill, seconded by Councillor Zwart

That the meeting adjourn at 10:14 PM.

Carried

---

Mayor

---

Municipal Clerk

# **Newcastle Memorial Arena Management Board**

## **Municipality of Clarington**

### **Minutes of Meeting – Tuesday November 13, 2018**

**(Not yet approved by committee)**

**In Attendance** – Gord Lee, Chair

Bryan Wiltshire, Arena Manager

Gary Oliver, Susan White, Carol Little, Councillor Partner, Councillor Woo

**Regrets:** Shea-Lea Latchford, Peter Kennedy

1. **Adoption of Minutes Motion # 18 – 019** was proposed: **THAT:** The minutes of September 11, 2018 are accepted as presented.

**Moved** by: Carol Little

**Seconded** by: Susan White

**CARRIED**

2. **Arena Manager's Report** – Copies of the minutes from the Community Operations Meeting of February 28, 2018 that Bryan attended were provided to our members. Bryan had just received them from the municipality. Fully discussed by our board members, there were a number of items listed in the minutes that had not been followed up on by the municipality. Primarily, items 1-3, 1-4, 1-12 in Workplace Inspection Program. Item # 2-1 in Capital Budget Report had not been received from municipality and item 3-6 Fire Drill had not been conducted by our staff.  
Snow plowing contracts from Sunnyside Acres, Jeff Stapleton and Foss Maintenance, Troy Foster had been received and were in place for the winter season of 2018-19 – November to March. (Parking Lot by Sunnyside priced at \$130.00 per plow, sanding and/or salting at our request only, at \$100.00 per application. Sidewalks to be cleared by Foss Maintenance at \$525.00 for the season. Both plowing contracts are subject to H.S.T.  
Operations Policy Directive was discussed and referred to a future meeting. Copies will be provided to our new board members when the next committee is formed in early 2019.

(2)

Gary Oliver brought up the concern of additional lighting being required in the south-east corner of the parking lot. Concerns for the neighborhood houses in that area was also discussed. Additional lighting may be an irritation to residents behind the fence. Bryan will follow-up with the municipality to try and rectify the situation, without annoying our neighbors.

Susan White provided a sample form for discussion regarding a more efficient means for our arena manager to report back to the board members. Bryan will implement it over the next few meetings to see how it works.

3. **Financial Report:** An income statement for Y.T.D. October 31, 2018 was provided. Revenue comparison to October of 2017 was off by \$7,678.00. November/December 2018 should bring our sales forecast back on target. October accounts receivables were at \$56,000.00 of which 87% were current.
4. **Next Meeting** – No meeting will take place in December. A Christmas gathering of members and spouse/partners will take place on December 11<sup>th</sup>. location to be determined.
5. **Adjournment** **Motion # 18 – 020** was proposed: **THAT:** This meeting is adjourned

**Moved** by: Councillor Partner

**Seconded** by: Peter Kennedy

**CARRIED**



Agricultural Advisory Committee of Clarington Meeting

**Thursday, January 10, 2019**

Members Present: Don Rickard      Tom Barrie      Ted Watson  
Brenda Metcalf      Richard Rekker      John Cartwright  
Ben Eastman      Les Caswell      Eric Bowman  
Councillor Zwart

Regrets: Jennifer Knox, Henry Zekveld

Guests: Lisa Mackenzie and Nancy Rutherford, Region of Durham  
Planning and Economic Development

Staff: Amy Burke, Faye Langmaid,

---

Brenda welcomed all to the meeting, with introductions.

Adoption of Agenda

**019-01**      *Moved by Don Rickard, seconded by Eric Bowman*

*“That the Agenda for January 10<sup>th</sup>, 2019 be adopted”*

**Carried**

Approval of Minutes

**019-02**      *Moved by Tom Barrie, seconded by Richard Rekker*

*“That the minutes of the December 13, 2018 meeting be approved”*

**Carried**

**Presentation**

Region of Durham Local Food Business Retention & Expansion Project – Lisa and Nancy provided an overview of how the interviews were conducted, the sub-sectors interviewed and the results of the study. The presentation provided by Lisa was sent to committee members as a pdf.

There are some interesting findings on consumer behavior, the consumer is educating the producer on what they want and what should be grown. The market intelligence coming out of the study provides some emerging trends. The Committee members

expressed that consumer behaviour / needs is a potential area of further examination and research.

There is use of the OFVAC facility by Durham producers, it is now very busy and considering if it needs a night shift. There is a need for a commercial kitchen in Durham.

Next Steps include analysis of the information, an action plan and implementation plan. The results will feed into the Durham Agriculture Strategic Plan Update.

## **Business Arising**

*CA Watershed Plans* as follow-up to the presentation at the last meeting comments have been provided to CLOCA with regard to the questions the committee has about the 46% natural cover target when the Region's Official Plan is 30%, it appears that target is trying to make up for what has been lost in other urbanized watersheds. The mapping needs to account for the Agricultural System issued by OMAFRA last year. The committee would like to see the stewardship project funding for environmental farm plan initiatives reinstated by CLOCA. Habitat Enhancement needs to be defined, is it tree planting, allowing land to go fallow, late hay harvest, cover crops? A program could be developed for 10 acre lots that are not farmed to turn them into habitat enhancement areas, such as meadows and targeted tree planting areas.

*Zone Clarington* has open houses planned for late January and early February. If you have comments in advance of then please let Amy know. There have already been some feedback on potential mapping errors which is very useful for us.

## **Council and Committee Reports**

Council Items: Referral of the request from Durham Region for a member of DAAC. Tom Barrie volunteered to be the representative from Clarington to DAAC.

Durham Agriculture Advisory Committee: The DAAC Tour will be September 12<sup>th</sup>.

Durham Region Federation of Agriculture: (Durham Farm Connections) Richard provide the DRFA report to all by e-mail in advance of the meeting.

The Farm Connections will be at Vipod Arena on April 2, 3, 4. The Agricultural Gala will be October 24<sup>th</sup>. Farm Connections has a consultant working on the plan for a Regional agricultural historical home, what form it should take, funding and programming.

Clarington Board of Trade: CBOT issued a note reminding members of CBOT about caution near farm vehicles in December. Committee members are curious about the planning for the Agricultural Summit.

## **New Business**

Appointments to AACC – are to be ratified by Council on January 14<sup>th</sup>, most existing members up for renewal. Council representative will be Councillor Zwart who is familiar with the committee, having attended a number of times in the past.

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair – Will be on the agenda for next meeting.

Barn Fire Information from OMAFRA and Chief Weir– Distributed by e-mail prior to the meeting.

Climate Change –Regional Agricultural Adaptation Strategy – Donald provided an overview of the document that has been circulated to all. Future weather predictions (2040-2049) indicate that it will be warmer, wetter and wilder. It is hoped that members will review and provide comments to Kristy Kilbourne [Kristy.Kilbourne@durham.ca](mailto:Kristy.Kilbourne@durham.ca) by the end of January.

Durham Agriculture Strategic Plan – the previous plan was 2013-2018, the Region has hired a consultant to assist with preparation of an updated strategy. Brenda attended meeting earlier today to provide input. There was discussion on how the targets have to be measurable and the need for reporting, monitoring. Lisa and Nancy will come in March to AACC for input into the next 5 year strategy. Committee is looking for an update on what has been achieved as part of the presentation.

### **Future Agendas**

Health Canada representative to discuss the concerns heard at the July 12, 2018 AACC meeting regarding the Pest Management Regulatory Agency's re-evaluation of EBDC as it relates to fruit and vegetables.

Clarington Planning to share details of the agricultural sector evaluation completed as part of the Clarington Community Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory Update (completed in September 2018).

John is working on invitation to the Premier.

Faye has been in contact with Tracey Weightman, DRPS about a tour/meeting at the detachment in Maple Grove.

Clarington Planning to review the first draft zoning by-law regulations relating to Environmental Protection and associated buffers and related permissions for agriculture.

March meeting – Nancy Rutherford and Lisa Mackenzie will be back with the Durham Agriculture Strategy (next 5 year installment).

John Cartwright moved to Adjourn.

**Next Meeting: Thursday, February 14, 2019 @ 7:30 pm**

## **CLARINGTON HERITAGE COMMITTEE**

### **Minutes of Meeting January 15, 2019**

**Members Present:** Katharine Warren, Victor Suppan, Peter Vogel, Councillor Hooper, Steve Conway, Heather Ridge (ED of Clarington Museum)

**Regrets:** Robert Malone

**Staff:** Faye Langmaid, Planning Services

#### **Declaration of Pecuniary Interest**

None declared.

#### **Adoption of Agenda**

**19.01** Moved by K. Warren, seconded by S. Conway

That the agenda for January 15, 2019 be adopted as amended.

“CARRIED”

#### **Adoption of Minutes**

**19.02** Moved by K. Warren, seconded by S. Conway

That the minutes of the Meeting of November 18, 2018 be accepted.

“CARRIED”

#### **Delegation and Presentations**

Paul Wirch, Senior Planner from Planning Services provided an overview of the Bowmanville East Secondary Plan, area it covers, process, highlighting some of the historic buildings that are part of the planning process. The Goodyear Special Project Area is included in the Secondary Plan as is the Hospital and the downtown. There is a website for the project which members can subscribe to [www.Clarington.net/BowmanvilleEast](http://www.Clarington.net/BowmanvilleEast). An HIA has been prepared for Goodyear however it is incomplete. The HIA will need to be revised in the context of the site constraints (i.e. contamination, natural heritage, structural assessment, etc.) that have yet to be investigated. .

The Nurse's Residence was added to the Municipal Register and the Hospital was requested to prepare an HIA as part of their planning documents.



The downtown and civic precinct have a number of heritage buildings designated and listed. An overall characterization of the heritage resources is part of the background work that is being prepared for the Secondary Plan.

Further communications about the Bowmanville East update will be made to this Committee via the Municipal staff liaison. However, any member of the public can be added to the list of people to be contacted directly for all upcoming reports and meetings related to this project.

Paul also provided a brief update on the Courtice Energy Park Secondary Plan, the major heritage resource in that area is the Fairfield House on Crago Road. Unless further direction is given from this Committee, the existing preservation policies in the Secondary Plan for this home will be maintained. There are two abandoned cemeteries in the area but neither are within the boundary of the Secondary Plan.

Paul outlined where the South West Courtice Secondary Plan is occurring. There is an application for a subdivision across the road from a designated site on Prestonvale.

## **Business Arising**

### Wilmot Heritage Park update:

- No update at this time.

### Jury Lands Foundation update

K. Warren is now a director of the Foundation. The developer applied for a demolition permit for the 6 designated buildings in early December. They have been informed that their application does not meet the requirements of the Ontario Heritage Act as they will need to prepare an HIA that demonstrates how they will mitigate and adapt the site to address the heritage resources. The JLF and ACO are closely monitoring the site.

## **Reports from Other Committees**

### Orono, Bowmanville and Newcastle CIP

Liaison groups are meeting later this week and next week. Council appointments have been made to groups, all the groups have had new members join them. The annual report for CIPs was approved at Council on Jan 14, 2018. Also approved was the report on the pilot project for the outdoor sidewalk patios which will continue in 2019 and be expanded to Orono should there be a business that wishes to apply.

### Museum:

- The Museum's new children's exhibit ClaringTOWN with a rural theme is almost entirely set up – H. Ridge showed photos of the set up and indicated that there would be a members opening on Jan 31<sup>st</sup> and family opening on Feb 2<sup>nd</sup>.
- Edwardian Christmas will take place on December 7th right after the tree lighting, 264 attended.

- New Board has just been appointed a representative will be discussed at their next meeting. H. Ridge happy to attend in the meantime.

Architectural Conservancy Ontario, Clarington Branch - Doors Open subcommittee is meeting this evening and working on locations and plans for 2019.

Newcastle Village & District Historical Society - No report from NVDHS.

### **Correspondence and Council Referrals**

- The Belmont house By-law approved by Council in December.
- Terms of Reference of the Committee were amended to include a representative from ACO as requested at the November meeting. Faye will be contacting to have them appoint a representative.
- Abandoned Cemeteries Board was disbanded by Council.
- Appointments to Committees made at Jan 14<sup>th</sup> meeting, as the Heritage Committee does not have enough members, the notice for applications will be published on website and in newspaper. If you know of people interested please have them apply.
- Election of Chair and Vice-Chair may be delayed until membership is all in place.

**Project Reports** – No reports for this meeting

### **New Business**

Calendars:-15 have been sold, the calendars do not have the dates in them so can continue to be sold at AppleFest and other key times of the year.

Community Heritage Ontario (CHO) newsletter – article by Michael Seaman, Michael has accepted position of Director of Planning Services and will be starting in Feb. Committee members would like Michael invited to a future meeting (most likely March).

156 Church Street– Plaque has been installed. Members wondering if something can occur at the Feb 19<sup>th</sup> Planning and Development Committee meeting to honour designations and remind Council about the committee's accomplishments. Faye will see what can be done.

Committee Orientation – Faye has been in contact with Bert Duclos and he is willing to provide an overview to a larger Durham audience. It is on his to do list once has been informed that committee appointments across the Region are in place.

Goals for Committee – Vic would like to see a farm designated and also historic trees.

S. Conway moved adjournment.

**Next meeting:** February 19th, 2019, 7:00 p.m., Council Chambers for Planning and Development Committee meeting and then move into regular meeting.



If this information is required in an alternate format, please contact the Accessibility Co-ordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131

Active Transportation and Safe Roads Advisory Committee  
January 17, 2019  
7:00 pm  
40 Temperance St., Bowmanville  
Boardroom 1C

---

## **MINUTES**

Draft minutes not yet approved by Committee

Present: Frank Barter, Jim Boate, Angela Bramley, Melissa Claxton-Oldfield, Richard Claxton-Oldfield, Bart Hawkins Kreps, Councilor Janice Jones, Arnold Mostert, Jerry Petryshyn, Rick Stockman, Jeanne Winters

Regrets: None

Staff Present: Ron Albright, Steve Brake, Rob Brezina, Kristin Bullied, Carlos Salazar, Peter Windolf, Leanne Walker

### **1. Agenda**

Moved by Angela Bramley seconded by Bart Hawkins Kreps.

That the agenda be altered to add Clarington representation on the Regional Active Transportation Committee.

Carried

### **2. Minutes of October 11, 2018**

Moved by Jim Boate seconded by Jerry Petryshyn.

That the minutes of the ATSR meeting held on October 11, 2018 be approved.

Carried

### **3. Election of Chair and Vice Chair**

Election of Chair moved by Jim Boate seconded by Jeanne Winters.

Angela Bramley was nominated, agreed to stand, and was elected the Chair of the ATSR Committee.

Election of Vice Chair moved by Jeanne Winters seconded by Angela Bramley.

Rick Stockman was nominated, agreed to stand, and was elected Vice Chair of the ATSR Committee.

Carried

### **4. Presentations**

#### **Public communication options - Leanne Walker**

Leanne Walker from Clarington Communications Division attend to provide the committee with an overview of the various social media and communication options the committee could use to communicate with the public. The ATSR Committee would draft a message, Communications would review/revise and post online. Communications can also assist with brainstorming ideas for messaging and delivery. Clarington has a [Facebook page](#), [twitter account](#), [events calendar](#) and an [Active Transportation \(AT\) webpage](#) that the committee can use. If the committee wishes to use twitter they could prepare messages in advance that Communications would post on future dates. Communications encourages ATSR Committee members to send photos to post on the Clarington website. Hard copy materials such as a committee brochure could be designed and printed for the committee by the municipality. The ATSR Committee is able to receive feedback from the public using the 'contact us' section of the ATSR webpage. When specific feedback is required Engage Clarington can be used (<https://engageclarington.ca/>) to obtain public input on a specific question or issue. ATSR Minutes are uploaded to the Clarington website once approved by Council; further information in Attachment 1.

#### **Secondary Plans - Carlos Salazar**

Carlos Salazar, Manager of Community Planning and Design, provided an overview of the planning process as it relates to Active Transportation. The Official Plan designates land in the municipality based on general uses, Secondary Plans provide more detailed plans for particular areas of a municipality. Clarington's Secondary Plans focus on sustainability, protection of natural environment and active transportation. All future development, up to 2031 will be outlined on Secondary Plans. Carlos presented samples of Secondary

Plans for the next phase of Wilmot Creek and the Bowmanville East Town Centre. Information on all Secondary Plans is available on Clarington's website. Each Secondary Plan has a Communications strategy e.g., surveys, email updates, public information centers, etc.

## **5. Discussion Items**

### **AT facilities on Liberty Street – Baseline Road to King Street**

Discussion with Region re: upcoming design projects on Liberty St; limited land availability presents a challenge in accommodating AT facilities on Liberty St between Baseline Rd and King St; considering various options, e.g., multi-use path; construction is expected to be complete by 2022.

### **AT Connection to Courtice Road GO Bus station**

Planning to include an AT connection to the Go Bus station; number and location of connections has not yet been determined.

### **AT facilities on Liberty Street- Longworth Ave to Con Rd 3**

Durham Region is looking for input from Clarington regarding design (including active transportation elements) for this part of Liberty; Durham Region typically does not directly reach out to public for input, instead public input is collected through the Municipality who conveys it to the Region; construction is expected to begin in 2021.

### **AT facilities along Baseline Rd in Bowmanville**

Green Rd and Lambs Rd will be part of Clarington's cycling facilities, Baseline Rd has been identified as a good candidate for an east-west connection; planning a trail from Baseline to the Waterfront Trail.

### **Active and Sustainable School Travel program**

Durham Region's Active and Sustainable School Travel Committee has applied for a Provincial grant to fund a School Travel Planning Coordinator position, this coordinator would investigate ways to encourage AT travel to/from school; eight schools would be selected, two of which would be in Clarington; representatives from each municipality/city within Durham Region is on this committee; a pilot program was completed at four schools to determine the success of various AT initiatives.

ACTION: Rob Brezina to circulate Active and Sustainable School Travel Committee presentation to ATSR Committee.

### **Trail Project Updates**

Farewell Creek trail is now paved. Grading the edges of the trail will be completed in the spring. The trail is still closed to public use. As part of the project a limestone path was constructed to replace a worn path along the north

side of the Robert Adam's pond. This new path provides a walking route to Worthington Drive from Robert Adams, and to the top of the Farewell valley.

Construction on Phase 2 of the Soper Creek Trail began in October. The contractor has completed the excavation and placement of the granular base on the majority of the trail route. Construction will continue in spring 2019.

#### **Trail connections to local roads**

Photos were presented showing the various options utilized by other Durham municipalities. There appears to be no consistent approach. The committee agreed that a trail Stop Sign should be installed at all intersections with roads and sidewalks. The paved trail should extend to the street with a depressed curb. P-gates could also be used at locations where there is a need to slow cyclists before entering a road, and/or to prevent vehicles from using a trail.

#### **Liability coverage for committee members**

The Durham Municipal Insurance Pool (DMIP) was asked about liability coverage for committee members. Committee members fulfilling the mandate of the committee as approved by Council would be covered. The committee questioned whether volunteers assisting with a committee event would also be covered if they are not members of the committee. Peter Windolf will follow up with the DMIP.

#### **AT&SR Policy for Hamlets**

Establish information/criteria to assist staff in determining when an AT element might be warranted e.g., safety, public concerns, etc. Aim to have complete by the end of year

ACTION: Ron to send Jeanne Winters more information

#### **CLOCA**

CLOCA is developing a Conservation Lands Masterplan and is requesting input from public. The committee suggested that a CLOCA representative be invited to a future meeting to provide additional information.

ACTION: Peter to contact Jamie Davidson to determine status and invite to attend upcoming ATSR Committee meeting.

#### **Durham Active Transportation Committee**

Councilor Granville Anderson is the Council representative and Constance Grey the citizen representative on the newly formed Durham Active Transportation Committee. The committee agreed that it would be beneficial to have regular communication with the Durham AT Committee representatives.

## **6. Other Business**

The ATSR Committee now has a tent and banner that can be used for events.

Roadwatch Program, incidents must be reported online:

[https://members.drps.ca/internet\\_explorer/guest\\_book/road\\_watch\\_report.asp](https://members.drps.ca/internet_explorer/guest_book/road_watch_report.asp)

## **7. Next Meeting**

The next regular meeting is scheduled for **Wednesday April 17**, 2019 at 7:00pm in Room 1C.

## **8. Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by Jerry Petryshyn seconded by Jim Boate  
That the meeting adjourn at 9:35 PM

Carried

## **Attachment 1**

### **Communications for the Clarington Active Transportation and Safe Roads Advisory Committee**

#### **What the Committee can do:**

- Identify what education or awareness campaigns would benefit Clarington residents. This might include:
  - General info: What is active transportation?
  - Why active transportation is important
  - Benefits of incorporating walking/cycling into your life
  - Bike lanes / How to use them
  - General tips or facts:
  - Safety tips to consider when walking/biking/skateboarding
  - Campaign targeted to encourage kids to walk or bike to school
- Draft social media messages that we can post throughout the year or during a specific campaign (Communications to refine and post)
- Take photos - we're always looking for great photos to use on the website or social media. Real photos around Clarington are more engaging than stock photos.
- Post events to Community Events Calendar
  - Register for free
  - Events approved by our Tourism staff

#### **What Communications can do:**

- Design posters or handouts
- Send out social media to our Facebook and Twitter followers
- Tourism staff will share and retweet where possible
- Revise web content or add new content where necessary if we are lacking information on the corporate website.
- We can attend meetings to facilitate the creation of a campaign, guiding the committee on things to consider:
  - Who is your audience?
  - What is the key message of the campaign
  - Timeline for the campaign?
  - How will you measure success?



## Report to Council Meeting of February 4, 2019

---

Subject: General Government Committee Meeting of Monday, January 21, 2019

---

### Recommendations:

**1. Receive for Information**

- (a) 8.1 Minutes of the Tyrone Community Hall Board dated November 21, 2018
- (b) 8.2 Carla Y. Nell, Vice President, Municipal and Stakeholder Relations, MPAC, Regarding 2018 Year-End Assessment Report

**2. Ralph Walton, Regional Clerk/Director of Legislative Services. Region of Durham, Regarding GO Rail Services Extension to Bowmanville**

That the following resolution of the Region of Durham, regarding GO Rail Services Extension to Bowmanville, be endorsed by the Municipality of Clarington:

Therefore be it resolved:

- 1. That the Region of Durham Council requests the Provincial government and Metrolinx to confirm the commitment to extend GO Rail service north of Highway 401 through Oshawa to Bowmanville by 2024 and proactively resolve all pending negotiations with CN and CP rail, understanding that this project has substantial economic and environmental benefits, will spur significant public and private investment, will create much needed job opportunities for the community both for the short and long term, has widespread community support - including from the residents, business community, development industry, Durham's post-secondary institutions, commuters, youth, and the agricultural community - and is embedded in the land use, transportation and transit plans of Oshawa, Clarington and the Region of Durham;
- 2. That the Region of Durham Council further requests Metrolinx to keep the Region apprised of the status of the aforementioned negotiations and the progress of the overall undertaking on a regular basis;

3. That Town of Whitby, City of Oshawa, Municipality of Clarington, County of Northumberland, Municipality of Port Hope, Town of Cobourg, County of Peterborough and City of Peterborough be forwarded a copy of this resolution and based on their support of the GO Rail Service Extension to Bowmanville that they also request that the Province and Metrolinx stand by the commitment to complete this project by 2024;
  4. That Region of Durham staff be authorized to engage the other stakeholders such as area municipal Councils, boards of trade, and the local development and business community by providing them a copy of this resolution and requesting that they join their municipal partners in calling upon the Province and Metrolinx to stand by the commitment to extend GO Rail service through Oshawa to Bowmanville by 2024; and
  5. That copies of this resolution be forwarded to the Honourable Doug Ford, Premier of the Province of Ontario; the Honourable Jeff Yurek, Minister of Transportation; Durham MPPs; Durham MPs; the Durham area municipalities; David Piccini, MPP, Northumberland-Peterborough South; the Chair, and the President and Chief Executive Officer of Metrolinx.
- 3. Laura Holmes, Secretary, Bowmanville BIA, Regarding Board of Management for the Historic Downtown Bowmanville BIA 2018-2022 term**

That the Correspondence Item 9.2, from Laura Holmes, Secretary, Bowmanville BIA, regarding the Board of Management for the Historic Downtown Bowmanville BIA 2018-2022 term, be received with thanks; and

That the following Board of Directors of the Bowmanville Business Improvement Area be appointed for a four-year term 2018-2022:

Justin Barry  
Laura Holmes  
Cathy Holmes  
Carrie Hooper  
Morgan James  
Edgar Lucas  
Gerri Lucas

**4. Frances Tufts, Regarding Inadequate Public Transportation in Ward 4**

Whereas, with inadequate public transit, people in the rural northern area of Clarington are deprived of the opportunity to pursue social and economic opportunities;

And whereas the current public transit routes and schedule result in a lengthy trip to go a short distance, often requiring many transfers;

And whereas the routes are not fully integrated with other regions in close proximity to Clarington;

Now therefore be it resolved that Metrolinx and the GO Transit Commission be requested to expand GO Transit services to include stops in Orono on the buses traveling between the GO parking lot at Hwy 2 and 115, and Peterborough, (the 88); and

That the Region of Durham be requested to expand the Durham Transit services to include routes and schedules to enable citizens in rural Clarington to travel in a safe, accessible, and timely manner.

**5. Pilot Youth Centre, Courtice (The Loft)**

That Report CSD-001-19 be received;

That 2019 funding requirements for the Courtice Youth Centre and the Newcastle Youth Centre be referred to the John Howard Society of Durham Region 2019 grant submission and considered by Council during the 2019 budget process; and

That all interested parties listed in Report CSD-001-19 and any delegations be advised of Council's decision.

**6. 2018 Accessibility Annual Status Update**

That Report CLD-003-19 be received; and

That Report CLD-003-19 be placed on the municipal website.

**7. Neighbourhood Character Study**

That Report COD-003-19 be received;

That the proposal received from MacNaughton Hermesen Britton Clarkson Planning Limited (MHBC) being the most responsive bidder meeting all terms, conditions and specifications of RFP2018-12 and subject to a satisfactory reference check, be awarded the contract for the provision of consulting services to complete the Neighbourhood Character Study;

That the funds required in the amount of \$ 58,451.71 (net HST rebate) be drawn from the following account:

Consulting & Zoning By-law Review # 100-50-130-00000-7160      \$58,451.71

That all interested parties listed in Report COD-003-19 and any delegations be advised of Council's decision by the Department.

**8. Assumption of Road Widenings**

That Report LGL-001-19 be received; and

That the By-law attached to Report LGL-001-19 be approved.

**9. Region of Durham Transportation Priorities in Clarington**

That Region of Durham staff be requested to attend the next General Government Committee meeting, or as soon as practicable, to address the issue of transportations priorities for the Municipality of Clarington under Regional jurisdiction; and

That the Region of Durham be requested to re-allocate the funds set aside for the proposed roundabout for Highway 57 and Regional Road 3, to other projects within the Municipality of Clarington, pending the above attendance.

**10. Memo from Faye Langmaid, Acting Director of Planning Services, Regarding Durham Agricultural Advisory Committee Representative Appointment**

That Tom Barrie be nominated as the Municipality of Clarington's appointee to the Durham Agricultural Advisory Committee, for a term ending December 31, 2022 or until a successor is appointed.

## Report to Council Meeting of February 4, 2019

---

Subject: Planning & Development Committee Meeting of Monday, January 28, 2019

---

### Recommendations:

#### 1. Receive for Information

- (a) 9.5 Heather Brooks, Director Watershed Planning & Natural Heritage, CLOCA, Regarding Preserving and Protecting our Environment for Future Generations: A Made-in-Ontario Environment Plan

- (b) PSD-009-19 2018 Planning Applications

#### 2. Correspondence from Faye Langmaid, Acting Director of Planning Services, to Michael Helfinger, Regarding Comments on Bill 66, *Restoring Ontario's Competitiveness Act, 2018*

That Communication Item 10.1 from Faye Langmaid, Acting Director of Planning Services, to Michael Helfinger, Regarding Comments on Bill 66, *Restoring Ontario's Competitiveness Act, 2018*, be endorsed.

#### 3. Correspondence from Beth Meszaros, Regarding her Delegation on Bill 66, *Restoring Ontario's Competitiveness Act, 2018*

That Beth Meszaros be advised of actions taken, regarding Bill 66, *Restoring Ontario's Competitiveness Act, 2018*.

#### 4. Applications by Delpark Homes (Prestonvale) Inc. for a Clarington Official Plan Amendment, Draft Plan of Subdivision and Zoning By-law Amendment to permit a 78 dwelling subdivision on the west side of Prestonvale Road and south of Southfield Avenue in Courtice.

That Report PSD-008-19 be received;

That the proposed Clarington Official Plan Amendment, Draft Plan of Subdivision and Zoning By-law Amendment submitted by Delpark Homes (Prestonvale) Inc. continue to be processed including the preparation of a subsequent report; and

That all interested parties listed in Report PSD-008-19 and any delegations be advised of Council's decision.

If this information is required in an alternate format, please contact the Accessibility Co-ordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131

## The Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington

By-law 2019-005

Being a By-law to exempt a certain portion of Registered Plan 10M-840 from Part Lot Control

Whereas the Council of the Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington deems it advisable to exempt from Part Lot Control, for Block 134 in Plan 10M-840 registered at the Land Titles Division of Whitby **(File # ZBA2018-0028)**;

Now Therefore Be It Resolved That the Council of the Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington enacts as follows:

1. That Subsection 5 of Section 50 of the Planning Act shall not apply to those lands described in Paragraph 2 within the By-law.
2. That this By-law shall come into effect upon being approved by the Municipality of Clarington and thereafter Subsection 5 of Section 50 shall cease to apply to Block 134 inclusive in Plan 10M-840.
3. Pursuant to Subsection 7.3 of Section 50 of the Planning Act, this By-law shall be in force for a period of three (2) years ending on February 26, 2021.

Passed in Open Council this 4<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2019.

---

Adrian Foster, Mayor

---

C. Anne Greentree, Municipal Clerk





If this information is required in an alternate format, please contact the Accessibility Co-ordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131

## The Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington

### By-law 2019-006

being a By-law to exempt a certain portion of Registered Plan 40M-2629 and Plan 40M-2602 from Part Lot Control

Whereas the Council of the Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington deems it advisable to exempt from Part Lot Control, for Block 1 in Plan 40M-2629 and Blocks 1, 4 and 5 in Plan 40M-2602 registered at the Land Titles Division of Whitby **(File # ZBA2018-0030)**;

Now Therefore Be It Resolved That the Council of the Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington enacts as follows:

1. That Subsection 5 of Section 50 of the Planning Act shall not apply to those lands described in Paragraph 2 within the By-law.
2. That this By-law shall come into effect upon being approved by the Municipality of Clarington and thereafter Subsection 5 of Section 50 shall cease to apply to Block 1 in Plan 40M-2629 and Blocks 1, 4 and 5 in Plan 40M-2602 inclusive.
3. Pursuant to Subsection 7.3 of Section 50 of the Planning Act, this By-law shall be in force for a period of three (3) years ending on February 26, 2022.

Passed in Open Council this 4<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2019.

---

Adrian Foster, Mayor

---

C. Anne Greentree, Municipal Clerk







## Planning Services Report

If this information is required in an alternate accessible format, please contact the Accessibility Coordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131.

---

**Report To:** Council

**Date of Meeting:** February 4, 2019

**Report Number:** PSD-010-19      **Resolution:**

**File Number:** PLN 33.3.10      **By-law Number:**

**Report Subject:** Resolution regarding Durham Region's Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study Report #2019-COW-3

---

### Recommendations:

1. That Report PSD-010-19 be received;
2. That the Resolution, Attachment 1 to Report PSD-010-19 be adopted;
3. That all interested parties listed in Report PSD-010-19 and any delegations be advised of Council's decision.

## Report Overview

Council wishes to inform Durham Region, York Region and the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks of its concerns with regard to any expansion of the Energy from Waste (EFW) facility, Durham York Energy Centre (DYEC).

## 1. Background

- 1.1 At the January 21, 2019 General Government Committee meeting, Council heard the delegations of Ms. Bracken and Ms. Gasser regarding Regional Municipality of Durham (Durham Region) report #2019-COW-3, 2019 Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study. In response, Council approved Resolution #GG-008-19 as set out in the following:

That the Delegations of Ms. Bracken and Ms. Gasser be referred to staff to report back to the Planning and Development Committee meeting of January 28, 2019, on a draft resolution in response to the Region's Report #2019-COW-3 2019 Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study, including the proposed administrative amendment to increase the maximum annual tonnage under the ECA to 160,000 tonnes.

- 1.2 Staff provided a draft resolution in a memo dated January 25, 2019 for discussion at the Planning and Development Committee meeting.
- 1.3 At the Planning and Development Committee meeting on January 28, 2019, delegates Ms. Bracken and Ms. Gasser submitted comments on the draft resolution. In addition, a revised resolution was introduced (see 2.1 below).
- 1.4 Committee referred the revised resolution to staff to review in light of the delegate submissions.

## 2. Staff Comments

- 2.1 The revised resolution referred to staff at the January 28, 2019 Planning and Development Committee meeting is as set out in the following:

Resolution #PD-0015-19

Whereas Regional Staff presented Report #2019-COW-3, Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study on January 16, 2019 to outline a number of processes, amongst them being:

- Endorsement of a long term waste management vision founded on managing waste as a resource;

- Commencement of public consultation and communications for the Regional Municipality of Durham's Long Term Waste Management Strategy (Update for 2021-2040);
- Authorization to apply to the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) to increase the processing limit of 140,000 tonnes per year to 160,000 tonnes per year at the Durham York Energy Centre (DYEC);
- Commencement of the focussed Environmental Assessment (EA) Terms of Reference for the future expansion of the DYEC to 250,000 tonnes per year with anticipated construction in 10-15 years.

Whereas Clarington is concerned that some of the actions are pre-judging the results of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy and are a more costly approach to waste diversion; and

Whereas Clarington is concerned with the on-going operational issues at the DYEC and in particular the air emissions (ambient and stack) which have shown exceedances in the past; and

Whereas the emissions sources tests at the DYEC from September 2018 indicate that it is operating at 91% of the ECA Compliance Approval Limit for NOx; and

Whereas Section 22.1 of the EA stipulates that the maximum amount of waste that may be processed at the DYEC is 140,000 tonnes per year; and

Whereas the Region committed to a 70% waste diversion target in the DYEC EA and the Host Community Agreement; and

Whereas on June 13, 2018 Regional Council approved anaerobic digestion (AD) with a mixed waste transfer and pre-sort facility as the preferred technologies for the Region's long term organic management strategy (Report #2018-COW-146) which is necessary to move from 55% to 70% diversion.

Now therefore be it resolved that:

1. Clarington Council requests Durham Region Council to direct to staff to:
  - a. Proceed with haste on renewing its commitment to waste reduction, reuse, and diversion by reviewing, updating, and consulting with the public on the Long Term Waste Management Strategy which envisions moving from waste to a resource;
  - b. Accelerate the AD process for implementation by Regional staff with a report to Regional Council before June 2019 outlining steps necessary to complete this project within a 3 year timeframe;



- c. Prepare a public consultation and communication plan, including anticipated timelines, to educate the community about the preferred technologies (approval as per #2018-COW-146), including the rationale, regulatory process, siting, opportunities for public input, and how the project contributes to the Region's 70% waste diversion target; and
  - d. Clarify how they intend to obtain the input of the public with respect to any proposed increase to the processing limit of the DYEC; and
  - e. Provide a timeline for verification of the long-term sampling system for dioxins and furans (AMESA), as required by the DYEC ECA and, upon completion of the work plan, report back on the results to Durham Region and Clarington Councils; and
  - f. Prepare and implement a communications plan to include greater promotion, education, enforcement and public awareness of the Region's waste management system;
2. Clarington write to the MECP and indicate that it is opposed to any amendment to the EA to increase the maximum amount of waste proposed at the DYEC beyond 140,000 tonnes per year without a full review under the *Environmental Assessment Act*, including the concerns listed above.
3. The concerns respecting local airshed quality be submitted to MECP regarding the sources and concentrations of NOx and SOx together with a request that the MECP prepare a report that identifies and evaluates the sources and concentrations of local airshed emissions, associated health risks, and overall air quality; and
4. That this resolution be circulated to the MECP, Durham Region, and area municipalities including York Region.

Referred

- 2.2 Review by staff has identified opportunities to amend the revised resolution to further the interests and concerns of the Municipality to the Regions and the Province. The amended resolution by staff is provided in Attachment 1. The proposed amendments are described below.
- 2.3 The revised resolution could be strengthened by adding the highlighted words in clause 1 e) about the DYEC's long-term sampling system for dioxins and furans (AMESA) as follows:
  - e) Post the work plan for the dioxins and furans long-term sampling system (AMESA) on the DYEC website, and provide a timeline for verification of the ~~long-term sampling system for dioxins and furans (AMESA)~~ system, as required by the DYEC ECA and, upon completion of the actions in the work plan report back on the results to Durham Region and Clarington Councils; and

The revised resolution omitted a clause contained in the staff prepared draft resolution regarding additional stack testing for the DYEC and the DYEC's ambient air monitoring program. It is recommended that this be inserted as clause 1 g):

g) Continue to perform both an additional annual source test at the DYEC and the DYEC Ambient Air Monitoring Program for at least 3 additional years, minimum; and

2.4 Ms. Bracken in her delegation requested the addition of the following three recitals to the resolution being:

1. Whereas the Region recognizes in 6.16 and 6.17 of Report #2019-COW-3 that the MECP has passed new and much more stringent air standards for SO<sub>2</sub> and new lower standards have also been proposed for NO<sub>2</sub> and that it is very likely that the ambient air monitoring stations operated by the Region will show exceedances for SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub>;
2. Whereas the EA identified potential risks in some scenarios for some pollutants when more stringent benchmarks were used to characterize risk;
3. Whereas the Regions' consultants used some of these outdated standards in the EA as toxicity reference values to characterize health risks;

Staff believe the first of Ms. Bracken's proposed recitals is repetitive of what Durham Region has already acknowledged in Report #2019-COW-3, and in our opinion this recital is not necessary.

Although Staff support the intent of the second and third of Ms. Bracken's proposed recitals, we suggest an alternative approach. In the correspondence to the MECP required by clause 3. of the resolution (Attachment 1) staff will highlight that any increase in waste processing capacity should require an Environmental Screening Process using current standards and benchmarks and will note the concern regarding the now obsolete standards used by the Region's consultants in the original EA documentation. In addition, when circulated for comment on the Environmental Screening Process we will request new and updated studies using current threshold requirements.

Further, Ms. Bracken requested an additional new clause 1 h) to the draft resolution as follows:

h) Prior to ANY upsizing of the incinerator, fund and complete an updated Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment (HHERA) using updated and proposed standards and health-based criterion and an updated emissions inventory taking into account the upsizing and thereafter consult on the updated Study;

Again, staff have an alternative recommendation to include this request as part of Clarington's comments to MECP in advance of the Environmental Screening Process.

- 2.5 Ms. Gasser, with the support of Ms. Bracken, requested the deletion of clause 1 b) regarding the acceleration of the anaerobic digestion (AD) process for the diversion of organic waste. The general discussion at the Committee meeting on January 28 indicated a preference to retain this clause.

Ms. Gasser recommended a number of rewordings, re-orderings and additions to clauses 1 c), d) and f), some of which related back to the deletion of the AD process clause. In response, clauses 1 e) and g) have been rewritten by staff using the suggestions provided by Ms. Gasser and supported by Ms. Bracken.

- 2.6 The changes recommended by Ms. Bracken and Ms. Gasser have, where applicable, been incorporated into the amended resolution (Attachment 1) referred by the Planning and Development Committee to staff.

- 2.7 In addition, Staff suggest a modification to Section 2 of the revised resolution as follows:

Clarington ~~write to~~ inform the MECP ~~and indicate that it is opposed to~~ of its position that any amendment to the EA to increase the ~~maximum amount of waste proposed at~~ processing limit of the DYEC beyond the current 140,000 tonnes per year ~~without~~ be contingent upon a full review of the proposal under the Environmental Assessment Act, ~~including~~ and include a consideration of the concerns listed above.

- 2.8 Staff recommend that the order of Section 2 and 3 be reversed so that all of the concerns listed will be captured in the letter to the MECP.

### 3. Concurrence

This report has been reviewed by the Municipal Solicitor who concurs with the recommendations.

### 4. Conclusion

- 4.1 Staff believe the amended resolution attached to this report will advance the Municipality's interests and concerns to the Regions and the Province.

Submitted by:



Faye Langmaid, RPP, FCSLA,  
Acting Director of Planning Services

Reviewed by:



Andrew C. Allison, B. Comm, LL.B  
CAO

---

Staff Contact: Faye Langmaid, Manager, Special Projects, 905-623-3379 x 2407 or  
flangmaid@clarington.net

Attachments:

Attachment 1 - Amended Resolution

List of interested parties to be notified of Council's decision is on file in the Planning Services Department.



**Amended Resolution:**

Whereas Regional Staff presented Report #2019-COW-3, Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study on January 16, 2019 to outline a number of processes, amongst them being:

- Endorsement of a long term waste management vision founded on managing waste as a resource;
- Commencement of public consultation and communications for the Regional Municipality of Durham's Long Term Waste Management Strategy (Update for 2021-2040);
- Authorization to apply to the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) to increase the processing limit of 140,000 tonnes per year to 160,000 tonnes per year at the Durham York Energy Centre (DYEC);
- Commencement of the focused Environmental Assessment (EA) Terms of Reference for the future expansion of the DYEC to 250,000 tonnes per year with anticipated construction in 10-15 years.

Whereas Clarington is concerned that some of the actions are pre-judging the results of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy and are a more costly approach to waste diversion; and

Whereas Clarington is concerned with the on-going operational issues at the DYEC and in particular the air emissions (ambient and stack) which have shown exceedances in the past; and

Whereas the emissions sources tests at the DYEC from September 2018 indicate that it is operating at 91% of the ECA Compliance Approval Limit for NO<sub>x</sub>; and

Whereas Section 22.1 of the EA stipulates that the maximum amount of waste that may be processed at the DYEC is 140,000 tonnes per year; and

Whereas the Region committed to a 70% waste diversion target in the DYEC EA and the Host Community Agreement; and

Whereas on June 13, 2018 Regional Council approved anaerobic digestion (AD) with a mixed waste transfer and pre-sort facility as the preferred technologies for the Region's long term organic management strategy (Report #2018-COW-146) which is necessary to move from 55% to 70% diversion;

Now therefore be it resolved that:

1. Clarington Council requests Durham Region Council to direct staff to:

- a) Proceed with haste on renewing its commitment to waste reduction, reuse, and diversion by reviewing, updating, and consulting with the public on the Long Term Waste Management Strategy which envisions moving from waste to a resource; and
  - b) Accelerate the AD process for implementation by Regional staff with a report to Regional Council before June 2019 outlining steps necessary to complete this project within a 3 year timeframe; and
  - c) Prepare a public consultation and communication plan, including anticipated timelines, to educate the community about the preferred technologies (approval as per #2018-COW-146), including the rationale, regulatory process, siting, opportunities for public input, and how the project contributes to the Region's 70% waste diversion target; and
  - d) Clarify how they intend to obtain the input of the public with respect to any proposed increase to the processing limit of the DYEC; and
  - e) Post the work plan for the dioxins and furans long-term sampling system (AMESA) on the DYEC website, and provide a timeline for verification of the AMESA system, as required by the DYEC ECA and, upon completion of the actions in the work plan report back on the results to Durham Region and Clarington Councils; and
  - f) Prepare and implement a communications plan to include greater promotion, education, enforcement and public awareness of the Region's waste management system; and
  - g) Continue to perform both an additional annual source test at the DYEC and the DYEC Ambient Air Monitoring Program for at least 3 additional years, minimum; and
2. The concerns respecting local airshed quality be submitted to MECP regarding the sources and concentrations of NO<sub>x</sub> and SO<sub>x</sub> together with a request that the MECP prepare a report that identifies and evaluates the sources and concentrations of local airshed emissions, associated health risks, and overall air quality; and
  3. Clarington inform the MECP of its position that any amendment to the EA to increase the processing limit of the DYEC beyond the current 140,000 tonnes per year be contingent upon a full review of the proposal under the Environmental Assessment Act, and include a consideration of the concerns listed above.
  4. That this resolution be circulated to the MECP, Durham Region, and area municipalities including York Region

# Presentations and Handouts

# Clarington Council PSD-010-19 draft Resolution

Linda Gasser

February 4, 2019

# Draw your attention to second & last “Whereas” clauses

## Municipality of Clarington

Attachment 1 to  
Report PSD-010-19

### **Amended Resolution:**

Whereas Regional Staff presented Report #2019-COW-3, Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study on January 16, 2019 to outline a number of processes, amongst them being:

- Endorsement of a long term waste management vision founded on managing waste as a resource;
- Commencement of public consultation and communications for the Regional Municipality of Durham's Long Term Waste Management Strategy (Update for 2021-2040);
- Authorization to apply to the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) to increase the processing limit of 140,000 tonnes per year to 160,000 tonnes per year at the Durham York Energy Centre (DYEC);
- Commencement of the focused Environmental Assessment (EA) Terms of Reference for the future expansion of the DYEC to 250,000 tonnes per year with anticipated construction in 10-15 years.

→ Whereas Clarington is concerned that some of the actions are pre-judging the results of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy and are a more costly approach to waste diversion; and

Whereas Clarington is concerned with the on-going operational issues at the DYEC and in particular the air emissions (ambient and stack) which have shown exceedances in the past; and

Whereas the emissions sources tests at the DYEC from September 2018 indicate that it is operating at 91% of the ECA Compliance Approval Limit for NO<sub>x</sub>; and

Whereas Section 22.1 of the EA stipulates that the maximum amount of waste that may be processed at the DYEC is 140,000 tonnes per year; and

Whereas the Region committed to a 70% waste diversion target in the DYEC EA and the Host Community Agreement; and

→ Whereas on June 13, 2018 Regional Council approved anaerobic digestion (AD) with a mixed waste transfer and pre-sort facility as the preferred technologies for the Region's long term organic management strategy (Report #2018-COW-146) which is necessary to move from 55% to 70% diversion;

Now therefore be it resolved that:

1. Clarington Council requests Durham Region Council to direct staff to:

# Flag clauses b) and g)

a) Proceed with haste on renewing its commitment to waste reduction, reuse, and diversion by reviewing, updating, and consulting with the public on the Long Term Waste Management Strategy which envisions moving from waste to a resource; and

→ b) Accelerate the AD process for implementation by Regional staff with a report to Regional Council before June 2019 outlining steps necessary to complete this project within a 3 year timeframe; and

c) Prepare a public consultation and communication plan, including anticipated timelines, to educate the community about the preferred technologies (approval as per #2018-COW-146), including the rationale, regulatory process, siting, opportunities for public input, and how the project contributes to the Region's 70% waste diversion target; and

d) Clarify how they intend to obtain the input of the public with respect to any proposed increase to the processing limit of the DYEC; and

e) Post the work plan for the dioxins and furans long-term sampling system (AMESA) on the DYEC website, and provide a timeline for verification of the AMESA system, as required by the DYEC ECA and, upon completion of the actions in the work plan report back on the results to Durham Region and Clarington Councils; and

f) Prepare and implement a communications plan to include greater promotion, education, enforcement and public awareness of the Region's waste management system; and

→ g) Continue to perform both an additional annual source test at the DYEC and the DYEC Ambient Air Monitoring Program for at least 3 additional years, minimum; and

2. The concerns respecting local airshed quality be submitted to MECP regarding the sources and concentrations of NOx and SOx together with a request that the MECP prepare a report that identifies and evaluates the sources and concentrations of local airshed emissions, associated health risks, and overall air quality; and
3. Clarington inform the MECP of its position that any amendment to the EA to increase the processing limit of the DYEC beyond the current 140,000 tonnes per year be contingent upon a full review of the proposal under the Environmental Assessment Act, and include a consideration of the concerns listed above.
4. That this resolution be circulated to the MECP, Durham Region, and area municipalities including York Region

# Second & last “**whereas**” clauses appear contradictory

- Second whereas properly advises Region **not to prejudge results of the Long Term Waste Management Plan (LTWMP)** review
- Last “Whereas” Clarington appears to prejudge outcomes of Mixed Waste Presort (MWP) pilot results and final business case for Organics Strategy, currently MWP and Anaerobic Digester
- At Jan.30 council staff indicated they will **report on Canada Fibres MWP pilot study results at Feb.27, 2019** Reg. Council meeting.
- Clarington could comment when report available and during LTWMP review and to Regional Council

## **Believe current motion should focus on proposed incinerator expansions –respectfully suggest removal of last “Whereas” clause**

- Without knowing at least MWP pilot results –thus not knowing potential impacts on incinerator capacity, operations , emissions or possible diversion improvements,
- Premature political support risks conveying that this trumps evidence based decisions-not good for Clarington.
- Premature political support moved current incinerator forward –decisions not evidence based-hurts everyone
- Operations to date have proven that multiple projections (e.g exceedances, cost, capacity) way off with “benefits” absent.
- Premature support for Durham’s organics strategy could undermine or potentially contradict future Clarington positions on the Organics strategy/components thereof



# For this reason respectfully suggest deletion of clause b) on page 2

- Premature, prejudices LTWMP process and in advance of imminent report on MWP (Feb.27.19)
- Time frame in clause b) unlikely to be achieved COW 146 considers phasing of project and estimated timeline for operational AD Sec. 3.12: ***The timeframe that was identified by the Respondents to have an operational AD facility was between 18 months and four years from notice to proceed.***
- **NTP** issued after regulatory Approvals – could be EA or other approvals process(es) –depends on technology

If you don't delete b as written) please consider amending b) as follows:

- *“That the Region continue to investigate the AD process with a recommendation report to Regional Council, together with a final (updated) business case”, at the earliest opportunity”*

Re-ordering clauses would help keep focus in motion on proposed incinerator expansions

- I respectfully suggest that proposed incinerator expansions your priority
- You could consider reordering & renumbering with b) if retained and c) to go **after** current d)

# Recent development –additional stack test for 2019

- Councillor Neal's motion to undertake an additional stack test in 2019 passed 14-10 - no commitment beyond that
- Re g) Currently only two AA stations – Courtice & Rundle - collecting data. DR staff comment was they continue until MoE tells us to stop
- Keep following comments re Soil Testing in mind for future

# Consider soil sampling when submitting future comments

- Soil sampling done in 2013, 2015, 2016 & 2017
- **Currently, next soil sampling event is scheduled for August 2020.**
- What's in ambient air deposits on soil and water
- Clarington should request increased frequency of soil sampling after AA exceedances e.g. as occurred with dioxins in May 2018, and
- Request restoration of 2 AA stations and at least annual soil testing when commenting on any capacity increases as a minimum

With minor amendments resolution articulates Clarington's position proposed incinerator expansions

- Evidence based decisions serve the best interests of your residents and the municipal corporation.
- The next few slides are provided as background to help inform your deliberations on the merits of retaining, amending or deleting the last “Whereas” and clause b)

# Source Separation a provincial priority

- Source separated organics (SSO) - residents sort where organics are generated e.g. green bin collection offered to Single Family and some townhouses in DR
- SSO –most cost effective & efficient, results in LESS contaminated organic materials than organics extracted by Mixed Waste Presort from garbage bags
- Toronto processes **SSO** at their AD
- York proposing AD processing **SSO**
- Durham Region - no plans to offer Green Bin organics collection to high density Multi-residential, future growth sector
- Could result in two tier system, confusing to residents

# Permitting challenges GHD reports 2017.

From page 51:

- ***The permitting of a Mixed Waste processing facility for municipal solid waste will have some challenges, as this will be a newer type of waste processing within the Province.***
- ***Similar facilities have operated in Ontario however there are none currently in operation.***
- ***Pg 10 Exec. Summary: For the merchant capacity scenario, it is noted that at the present time, there is no mixed waste pre-sort capacity of any significance in Ontario.***
- Staff indicated in 2018-COW-11 that Canada Fibres operates the only MWP in Ontario – location of Durham's MWP pilot study



# More reasons to not take premature position on Organics Strategy

- **Background Research, Technical and Options Analysis Report**
- AD Study Regional Municipality of Durham **GHD** version June 21, 2017
- **Copied & Pasted from report:**
- *It is noted that the Mixed Waste Pre-Sort Facility will need to have a capacity to manage the total Mixed Waste quantity.*
- **4.2.3 Organics Recovery from Mixed Waste (SF & MR) (page 17)**
- ***Not all the organic material available in the Mixed Waste stream will be able to be harvested through the Mixed Waste Pre-Sort Facility.***
- *In order to project the amount of organic material that can be isolated from the Mixed Waste stream....the following assumptions where used:*
  - *The current organics capture rate is 54 percent for the SSO single-family program.*
  - *Approximately 80 percent of the incoming organics are recovered during pre-sorting.*
  - *The contamination rate of the OFMW requiring pre-treatment is approximately 20 percent.*
  - *Approximately 65 percent of the incoming organics are recovered through the pre-sorting and organics pre-treatment processes and treated by the organics processing technology.*

# From GHD 21.06.17 version of Preliminary business case

## 5.1 Organics Management System (page 22)

*The following process steps have been identified as typical within a Pre-Sort/Transfer and Organics Management Facility:*

- • **Transfer:** Unloading area for Mixed Waste and SSO from curbside collection vehicles and transfer of residual to DYEC.
- • **Material Receipt:** Acceptance of the Mixed Waste and removal of unwanted and unacceptable material prior to processing.
- • **Mixed Waste Pre-Sorting:** Primary and secondary staged dry separation equipment to isolate from the feedstock materials items such as residual materials, recyclable materials, and organic materials.
- • **Organics Pre-Processing:** The primary and secondary equipment (dry and/or wet separation equipment) or mechanism for preparing the organic feedstock for processing. This may include pre-processing equipment specific to the organics processing technology.
- • **Organics Processing:** The specific technology used for the organic processing.
- • **Post-Processing:** Equipment used to polish or refine the organic product, including screening, dewatering, or further composting.
- • **Product Management:** Equipment used to further sort or treat the various products (e.g., recyclables, residue, biogas utilization, etc.) generated from the pre-processing and organics processing systems.

# System components

- **5.1.5.3 Anaerobic Digestion (page 27)**
- *The increased implementation of Mixed Waste pre-sort processing plants in Europe has pushed the development of Anaerobic Digestion technologies that are designed and tested to process Mixed Waste. **The OFMW has a higher contamination rate than most SSO streams.***
- 
- **5.2.1 Process Related (page 31-32)**
- • **Building for Mixed Waste Pre-Sorting**
- - Oversize Screening, Bag Opening, Size Separation, Other
- • **Building for Organics Pre-Processing**
- - Dry Separation Equipment, Wet Separation Equipment
- • **Building for Organics Processing**
- - Composting Vessels, CSTRs (Outdoor), Plug Flow Reactors (Indoor), Percolate Bunker Reactors (Indoor)
- • **Building for Post Processing**
- - Composting Curing Pads / Storage Area, Liquid Digestate Storage, Digester Solids Storage, Fuel Feedstock Storage

# Process support continued

- **5.2.2 Process Support**
- • *Material Receipt*
- - *Weigh Scale Facility, Initial Mixed Waste Storage/Buffering Capacity*
- • *Product Management*
- - *Final Recyclables, Residual Waste, Refuse/Solid Waste Fuel, Biogas Conditioning, Biogas Treatment & Utilization, Biogas Flare*
- • *Traffic Management*
- - *Chemical Delivery, Outbound Loading for Final Products*
- **5.2.3 Facility Operations**
- • *Non-Waste Treatment*
- - *Process Water Treatment, Process Wastewater Treatment, Odour Management System, Electrical Stormwater Management*
- • *Facilities*
- - *Administration, Control Room, Power Supply and Distribution, Parking, Emergency Access*

Final product quality GHD pg 41

- ***It is also important to emphasize that the certainty by which quality of final products (e.g., fertilizers, compost, etc.) from organics can be created from SSO is currently greater than it is for Mixed Waste organics (OFMW)***

Cost estimates in 2017 Prelim. Bus Case –NOT provided to Reg. Councillors June 6 or 13, 2017. Prelim. Exec Summary pg 10

*The business case illustrated the following net present cost for the Status Quo and the net preset cost ranges for the other scenarios studied:*

- *Status Quo: \$279.4M*
- *Mixed waste pre-sort/in-vessel aerobic composting:*
- *\$444.5M to \$547.9M*
- *Mixed waste pre -sort/anaerobic digestion:*
- *\$446.1M to \$554.6M*
- *Mixed waste pre -sort/merchant capacity:*
- *\$496.4M to \$633.8M*

*Per the above analysis, the scenarios studied present increases in overall costs compared to the Status Quo option.*

# Then from 2018 -COW 146 –pgs 11-12

- The up-front capital costs for transfer/pre-sort and organics processing are estimated at \$160 to \$170 million, including land, for both organics processing options (not including biogas upgrading facility)
- Sensitivity analysis suggests that the capital costs could range from \$120 million to \$200 million;
- Combined annual operating expense and debenture servicing costs would range from \$42.1 million to \$42.8 million in the first year, **assuming a \$165 million capital project.**

# Page 14 Cow 146 est. operating costs

**Table 6: Status Quo Compared to Expanded Organics Processing – Annual Preliminary Cost for 2022 First Year of Operations (Nominal Dollars)**

	Status Quo (32,100 tonnes) (\$ millions)	AD (72,900 tonnes) (\$ millions)	In-Vessel (72,900 tonnes) (\$ millions)
<u>Pre-Sort/Transfer Costs:</u>			
Annual Pre-Sort Transfer Costs	-	10.3	10.3
Less: Recycling and EPR Revenues	(0.4)	(1.5)	(1.5)
<b>Total Pre-Sort/Transfer Operations</b>	<b>(0.4)</b>	<b>8.7</b>	<b>8.7</b>
<u>Processing Costs:</u>			
Annual Processing Costs	6.6	9.6	9.6
Other Costs (By-product management, disposal) <sup>(3)</sup>	1.4	3.0	3.7
<b>Total Processing and Other Costs</b>	<b>8.0</b>	<b>12.6</b>	<b>13.2</b>
<b>Debt Service Payment</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>20.8</b>	<b>20.8</b>
<b>Net Operating Cost</b>	<b>7.6</b>	<b>42.1</b>	<b>42.8</b>



**Delegation to Clarington Council  
By Wendy Bracken  
February 4th, 2019  
Report PSD-010-19**

Resolution regarding Durham Report 2019-COW-3  
Durham Region's Solid Waste Management Servicing and  
Financing Study including  
Proposed Incinerator Expansion

# Amended Resolution

## Please Adopt Below As Is

**Municipality of Clarington**

**Attachment 1 to  
Report PSD-010-19**

**Amended Resolution:**

Whereas Regional Staff presented Report #2019-COW-3, Solid Waste Management Servicing and Financing Study on January 16, 2019 to outline a number of processes, amongst them being:

- Endorsement of a long term waste management vision founded on managing waste as a resource;
- Commencement of public consultation and communications for the Regional Municipality of Durham's Long Term Waste Management Strategy (Update for 2021-2040);
- Authorization to apply to the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) to increase the processing limit of 140,000 tonnes per year to 160,000 tonnes per year at the Durham York Energy Centre (DYEC);
- Commencement of the focused Environmental Assessment (EA) Terms of Reference for the future expansion of the DYEC to 250,000 tonnes per year with anticipated construction in 10-15 years.

Whereas Clarington is concerned that some of the actions are pre-judging the results of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy and are a more costly approach to waste diversion; and

Whereas Clarington is concerned with the on-going operational issues at the DYEC and in particular the air emissions (ambient and stack) which have shown exceedances in the past; and

Whereas the emissions sources tests at the DYEC from September 2018 indicate that it is operating at 91 % of the ECA Compliance Approval Limit for NO<sub>x</sub>; and

Whereas Section 22.1 of the EA stipulates that the maximum amount of waste that may be processed at the DYEC is 140,000 tonnes per year; and

Whereas the Region committed to a 70% waste diversion target in the DYEC EA and the Host Community Agreement; and

# Still Issues With Last Whereas Statement Below

Please consider removing - it implies premature endorsement of AD with mixed waste pre-sort , prior to pilot study results going to to Regional and prior to consultation on Long Term Waste Management Study

Whereas on June 13, 2018 Regional Council approved anaerobic digestion (AD) with a mixed waste transfer and pre-sort facility as the preferred technologies for the Region's long term organic management strategy (Report #2018-COV-146) which is necessary to move from 55% to 70% diversion;

# **Please Delete or Alternatively Re-Word Section b) As Written Section b) Would Pre-Judge LTWMS Results**

Replace “accelerate” with “Continue to investigate” and delete highlighted section

- b) Accelerate the AD process for implementation by Regional staff with a report to Regional Council before June 2019 outlining steps necessary to complete this project within a 3 year timeframe; and

## Monitoring Section g)

–in future ask for continuance of annual soil monitoring, too

- g) Continue to perform both an additional annual source test at the DYEC and the DYEC Ambient Air Monitoring Program for at least 3 additional years, minimum; and

**Message to MECP Must Be Clear:**  
**Full Review of Health and Ecological Risks Using  
Updated Health-based TRVs and Standards Is Needed**

3. Clarington inform the MECP of its position that any amendment to the EA to increase the processing limit of the DYEC beyond the current 140,000 tonnes per year be contingent upon a full review of the proposal under the Environmental Assessment Act, and include a consideration of the concerns listed above.

## Please Add the Bolded Clause to 3.

3. Clarington inform the MECP of its position that any amendment to the EA to increase the processing limit of the DYEC beyond the current 140,000 tonnes per year be contingent upon a full review of the proposal under the Environmental Assessment Act that **applies appropriate and up to date health-based toxicity reference values and standards** and includes a consideration of the concerns listed above.

## **It is Important For Clarington to Stress The Important EA History to the MECP**

- the Regions' consultants used some of these outdated standards in the EA as toxicity reference values to characterize health risks
- the EA identified potential risks in some scenarios for some pollutants when more stringent benchmarks were used to characterize risk;



# Regions' Consultants Used Outdated Standards as Toxicity Reference Values To Characterize Health Risk in the EA Despite Concerns Registered by Expert Reviewers

<https://www.durhamyorkwaste.ca/Archive/pdfs/study/ea-study-docs/studydoc-july31/Appendix-C-12-HHERA-Technical-Study-Report.pdf>

**Table 7-2 Summary of TRVs and Inhalation Benchmarks Selected for CACs in the HHRA**

CAC	Duration	Value ( $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ )	Critical Effect	Reference Type	Source
Sulfur Dioxide ( $\text{SO}_2$ )	1-Hour	690	Health-Based	Benchmark	MOE AAQC, 2008b
	24-Hour	275	Health-Based	Benchmark	MOE AAQC, 2008b
	Annual Average	29	Health-Based	Benchmark	Health Canada, 2006
Hydrogen Chloride (HCl)	1-Hour	75	Health-Based	Benchmark	AENV AAQO, 2007
	24-Hour	20	Health-Based	Benchmark	MOE AAQC, 2008b
	Annual Average	20	Hyperplasia of nasal mucosa larynx and trachea	RfC	US EPA, 1995c
Hydrogen Fluoride (HF)	1-Hour	25	Redness of the skin and some burning and irritation of the nose and eyes	Benchmark	TCEQ ESL, 2008
	24-Hour	NV			
	Annual Average	NV			
Nitrogen Dioxide ( $\text{NO}_2$ )	1-Hour	400	Respiratory Irritation	Benchmark	MOE AAQC, 2008b
	24-Hour	200	Respiratory Irritation	Benchmark	MOE AAQC, 2008b
	Annual Average	60	Health-Based	Benchmark	Health Canada, 2006
Carbon Monoxide	1-Hour	15,000	carboxyhaemoglobin (COHb) blood level of less than 1%.	Benchmark	Health Canada, 1994b
	24-Hour	NV			
	Annual Average	NV			
Particulate Matter ( $\text{PM}_{10}$ )	1-Hour	NV			
	24-Hour	50	Health-Based	Benchmark	MOE AAQC, 2008b
	Annual Average	NV			
Particulate Matter ( $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ )	1-Hour	NV			
	24-Hour	30	Health-Based	Benchmark	CCME, 2006b
	Annual Average	NV			
Total Particulate Matter	1-Hour	NV			
	24-Hour	120	Health-Based	Benchmark	Health Canada, 2006

# Big Changes to CAAQS Ambient Air Standards

## Nitrogen Dioxide (NO<sub>2</sub>)

- Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards (CAAQS) lowered
- current **200 ppb** lowered to **60 ppb** in 2020

# Health Effects of NO<sub>2</sub>

Who is Vulnerable?

Children, Older Adults, Asthmatics, Diabetics

Premature Mortality

Heart disease

Lung Disease

And the list goes on

# Canadian Ambient Air Quality Objectives (CAAQS)

**Current Priorities : Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment (CCME)**

(Below from [https://www.ccme.ca/en/current\\_priorities/air/caaqs.html](https://www.ccme.ca/en/current_priorities/air/caaqs.html))

## CAAQS

Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards (CAAQS) are the driver for air quality management across Canada. CAAQS for nitrogen dioxide were recently endorsed by ministers (see below). CAAQS have also been developed for, sulphur dioxide, fine particulate matter and ozone. Industry associations, non-governmental organisations and Indigenous organisations participate in the development and review of CAAQS. CAAQS are reviewed every five years to ensure they are stringent enough to protect human health and the environment. The CAAQS for ozone are currently under review.

# New CCME

## Air Quality Management Levels and Goals

	Range of Ambient Air Pollutant Concentrations			
Air Quality Management levels and goals**	NO <sub>2</sub> 1-hour CAAQS*** (ppb)		NO <sub>2</sub> Annual CAAQS*** (ppb)	
	2020	2025	2020	2025
<b>RED</b> Reduce ambient pollutant concentrations below the CAAQS	> 60	> 42	> 17.0	> 12.0
<b>ORANGE</b> Prevent CAAQS Exceedance	> 31 and ≤ 60	> 31 and ≤ 42	> 7.0 and ≤ 17.0	> 7.0 and ≤ 12.0
<b>YELLOW</b> Prevent Air Quality Deterioration	> 20 and ≤ 31		> 2.0 and ≤ 7.0	
<b>GREEN</b> Keep Clean Areas Clean	≤ 20		≤ 2.0	

\*\* The management levels come into effect at the same time as their corresponding CAAQS.

\*\*\* The concentrations have the same statistical form as their corresponding CAAQS.

# Durham Report 2018-INFO-38

- 4.4 The CAAQS for nitrogen dioxide ( $\text{NO}_2$ ) was recently lowered to 60 parts per billion (ppb) starting in 2020. The current standard in Ontario for  $\text{NO}_2$  is 200 ppb. It is likely that the Ontario standard for this parameter will also be lowered in the near future resulting in future ambient air monitoring exceedances.

# Big Changes to Ambient Air Standards

## Sulfur Dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>)

- Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards (CAAQS) recently lowered
- Ontario Regulation 419 standard lowered from **690 mcg/m<sup>3</sup>** to **100 mcg/m<sup>3</sup>** (effective 2023)

# Durham Report 2019-COW-3

## DYEC Ambient Air Monitoring

- 6.16 In 2018, the MECP passed new air standards for sulphur dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>). Along with new stack emission standards, the ambient air quality criteria were also lowered significantly. The change corresponds to the changes made to the SO<sub>2</sub> Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards at the federal level and are intended to apply to large geographic areas that form a single air shed. While the DYEC stack tests and continuous emissions monitoring are consistently below the regulatory limits, it is very likely that the ambient air monitoring stations operated by the Region will show exceedances for SO<sub>2</sub> due to various activities in the surrounding area when the new standards take effect in 2020 (Federal) and 2023 (Ontario).



# Durham Report 2018-COW-INFO

- 4.3 SO<sub>2</sub> is continuously measured at the upwind and downwind ambient air monitoring stations, and results remain well below the current standard of 690 µg/m<sup>3</sup>. Assessing the current SO<sub>2</sub> results against the future CAAQS standard of 100 µg/m<sup>3</sup> indicates that regular exceedances will occur once the new levels are regulated. Ambient air monitoring conducted prior to the DYEC commencing operations would also result in exceedances of the lower 100 µg/m<sup>3</sup> SO<sub>2</sub> proposed standard.

# NOT SO FAST Durham Region!

## Our Health Should Matter

- Durham Region must be held accountable for site decision and incinerator decision
- Citizens, doctors, experts documented problems and warned Council
- **outdated standards**
- **poor assessment of risk** (based on these outdated standards)
- **overburdened air shed at Courtice site**

# **Using World Health Organization Benchmark Values:**

## **Potential Risk to Human Health Identified for PM2.5 and NO2 in Baseline Traffic and 140,000 tpy Cases**

**Table 7-11 pg 173, Table 7-21 pg 205, Table 7-22 pg 207-208, Table 7-53 pg 267**  
***Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment Technical Study Report,***  
**Dec 10, 2009**

**Table 7-11 Maximum Concentration Ratio (CR) Values using Baseline Traffic Case Air Concentrations for CACs**

COPC	Baseline Traffic Case Concentration Ratio (CR) Values			Baseline Traffic Case Concentration Ratio (CR) Values – WHO benchmarks <sup>b</sup>		
	1-hour	24-hour	Annual	1-hour	24-hour	Annual
Ammonia <sup>d</sup>	-	-	-	-	-	-
Carbon Monoxide (CO) <sup>bc</sup>	0.28	-	-	-	-	-
Hydrogen Chloride (HCl) <sup>d</sup>	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hydrogen Fluoride (HF) <sup>d</sup>	-	-	-	-	-	-
Nitrogen Dioxide (NO <sub>2</sub> )	0.39	0.53	0.77	0.78	-	1.2
Particulate Matter - PM <sub>10</sub> <sup>ac</sup>	-	0.021	-	-	0.021	0.010
Particulate Matter - PM <sub>2.5</sub> <sup>ac</sup>	-	0.70	-	-	0.84	0.99
Particulate Matter – Total <sup>a</sup>	-	0.31	0.36	-	-	-
Sulfur Dioxide (SO <sub>2</sub> )	0.031	0.071	0.21	-	0.16	-

<sup>a</sup> 1-Hour TRV Not Available

<sup>b</sup> 24-Hour TRV Not Available

<sup>c</sup> Annual Average TRV Not Available

<sup>d</sup> Not Included in the Traffic Case Assessment

<sup>e</sup> - Indicates WHO benchmark not available

Table 7-24 Concentration Ratio (CR) Values at 140,000 tpy for Chemical Mixtures at the Maximum Ground Level Concentration

COPC	Concentration Ratio (CR) Values – 140,000 tpy				
	Baseline Case	Project Alone	Project Case	Process Upset Case	Process Upset Project Case
<b>1-Hour</b>					
Eye Irritants	0.0048	7.1E-04	0.0055	0.0071	0.012
Nasal Irritants	0.0079	8.3E-04	0.0087	0.0083	0.016
Respiratory Irritants	0.33	0.23	0.56	1.5	1.9
Neurological Effects (Neurotoxicants)	0.026	2.1E-04	0.026	0.0021	0.028
<b>24-Hour</b>					
Eye Irritants	0.0083	4.5E-05	0.0083	4.5E-04	0.0087
Nasal Irritants	0.0079	4.1E-05	0.0079	4.1E-04	0.0083
Respiratory Irritants	1.1	0.098	1.2	0.77	1.9
Neurological Effects (Neurotoxicants)	0.55	1.2E-04	0.55	0.0012	0.55
<b>Annual</b>					
Nasal Irritants	0.035	1.4E-05	0.035	3.5E-05	0.035
Respiratory Irritants	0.94	0.0082	0.95	0.011	0.95
Neurological Effects (Neurotoxicants)	0.050	2.3E-04	0.050	3.5E-04	0.050
Reproductive/Developmental Effects	0.0073	1.5E-04	0.0074	2.1E-04	0.0075

# Site Selection Report Values

## Pre-incinerator Local Industrial Burden

<i>Industrial Emissions</i>	CO	NOx	PM	PM <sub>10</sub>	PM <sub>2.5</sub>	SO <sub>2</sub>	VOC
Clarington Totals	4392.0	6089.0	700.0	571.0	274.0	8703.0	4525.0
E. Gwillimbury Totals	50.2	5.1	77.1	81.9	41.2	0.3	1137.3

# Health Canada Expert EA Reviewer Cautioned Mitigation Needed for NO<sub>x</sub> Emissions

## *Nitrogen Oxides*

*Tables 7-3, 7-5 of the AQTSR and Tables 7-22 and 7-54 of the Site Specific Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment – Technical Study Report (HHERATSR) identify considerable increases in NO<sub>2</sub> levels as a result of the project. For example, the AQTSR indicates that the maximum predicted 1-hour NO<sub>2</sub> level is approximately 40% of the provincial air quality standard, with a large proportion of this attributable to the proposed project. Further, the predicted project-related NO<sub>2</sub> levels at receptors for both project scenarios (140,000 tpy and 400,000 tpy) are predicted to increase approximately two times over baseline.*

*Given that NO<sub>2</sub> plays a major role in the atmospheric reactions that produce ground-level ozone, which is known to be associated with respiratory and cardiovascular health effects, and that NO<sub>2</sub> by itself is linked with respiratory health effects (EPA, 1995), HC advises that the AQTSR discuss mitigation measures that may be applied to minimize project-related emissions.*

The values shown in the chart below are taken directly from *Table 7-1 Summary of Statistical Maximum Predicted Ground Level Contaminant Concentrations – Scenario 1A(MCR, 140,000 tpy Facility)* of the AQATSR and show those results for NO2 and for other contaminants as well.

Contaminant	Background Concentration (mcg/m3)	Predicted Statistical 1-Hr Max Concentration (mcg/m3)	Predicted Statistical 1-Hr Max Concentration + Background (mcg/m3)
Sulphur Dioxide	19.5	12.69	32.21
Nitrogen Dioxide	64.6	43.87	108.45
PM2.5	22.8	3.67	26.49
Dioxins	5.77E-08	2.18E-08	7.95E-08
Cadmium	1.47E-03	2.54E-03	4.01E-03
Lead	0.01	0.02	0.03
Nickel	0.01	0.03	0.04



# Health Canada Also Cautioned Mitigation Discussions Needed for PM2.5

## *Particulate Matter*

*Tables 7-2 and 7-3 of the Air Quality Assessment Technical Study Report (AQTSR) indicate that the 24-hour particulate matter less than 2.5 microns (PM2.5) maxima predicted for both the 140,000 tonnes per year (tpy) and 400,000 tpy project scenarios reach 70% and 71% respectively of the Canada Wide Standard (CWS) (CCME, 2000). Data from the National Air Pollutant Surveillance (NAPS) monitor located in Oshawa (Environment Canada, 2009) indicates that for the years 2002-2004 (the most recent years for which data is available on NAPS) the average 98<sup>th</sup> percentile for PM2.5 (24 hour averaging) is approximately 30 µg/m<sup>3</sup>, a level which corresponds to the Canada Wide Standard for PM2.5. Given that airborne levels of PM2.5 are already elevated in the vicinity of the project and that this contaminant is considered to be a non-threshold contaminant (i.e. adverse human health effects may be observed at any level of exposure), (CCME, 2000) HC suggests that the AQTSR discuss best available technologies and procedures that may be applied to mitigate PM2.5 emissions from the proposed facility.*

Health Canada Review (M. Lalani),  
Ministry Review of Durham/York EA

**Again:**

**Please Add the Bolded Clause to 3.**

3. Clarington inform the MECP of its position that any amendment to the EA to increase the processing limit of the DYEC beyond the current 140,000 tonnes per year be contingent upon a full review of the proposal under the Environmental Assessment Act that **applies appropriate and up to date health-based toxicity reference values and standards** and includes a consideration of the concerns listed above.

# Risk Assessment for PM2.5 Flawed

- Comparing against air quality objectives doesn't cut it
- No safe level
- Mass-based assessment but it is the number and size of particles that matter
- What attaches to the fine particulates matters greatly – incinerator emits MANY TOXINS
- Emerging research troubling – Clarington may have the perfect storm of pollutants